Cemetery Restoration Advisory Board
April 17, 2017    Meeting Minutes

Call to Order:
The meeting was called to order by Chair Zets at 11:00 a.m.

Roll Call:
   Brian Zets, Chair       P
   Denise Kohn, Vice Chair P
   Bill Resch              P
   Nancy Ferguson          P
   David Cline             P
   Mary Fee                P

Also present: Jennifer Mason, Clerk of Council/Staff Member

Approval of the April 12, 2017 meeting minutes:
Member Ferguson moved to approve the minutes and Member Resch seconded. All voting members approved and the minutes were passed.

Approval of the Agenda:
Chair Zets moved to accept the agenda. Member Resch seconded and all voting members approved the agenda.

Hearing of Visitors:
None present.

Finalize and approve the Board’s report and recommendations to council:
Member Ferguson led the Board through the report page by page. Changes were made on page 10 to split up the sections for current restoration and future maintenance. Changes were made on page 11 to add the Wagoner cemetery. At page 12, the Board discussed whether all estimates should be included in the written report and debated the word “costs” versus “estimates.” The Board agreed to keep all of the pictures in the appendix and took a group picture of all present for the report. Chair Zets moved to approve the report with the amendments (attached). Member Kohn seconded, and all voting members approved the report with the amendments.

Old Business:
None.
New Business:
Member Ferguson distributed a drafted resolution for city council to consider (attached). Chair Zets moved to approve the resolution conditioned on and subject to adjustments made by city staff. Member Resch seconded, and all voting members approved the resolution subject to city staff adjustments.

The Board worked on their presentation to council. Member Ferguson recommended pictures for Power Point. Various members agreed to present distinct topics to council. Member Ferguson volunteered to ask Public Service Director Mark Nemec to present on the topic of restoration and maintenance.

The Board discussed how Plain Township recently spent approximately $400,000 on upkeep of Maplewood cemetery.

Schedule the next meeting:
No subsequent meeting was scheduled due to the pending presentation to city council. It was agreed that additional meeting would be scheduled as needed.

Poll members for comment:
None.

Adjournment:
Chair Zets moved to adjourn. Member Ferguson seconded. The meeting was adjourned at 12:09 p.m.

Signed:

Brian Zets, Chair

Jennifer Mason, Clerk/Secretary

Date 6/23/17
CEMETERY RESTORATION ADVISORY BOARD REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION

New Albany Cemetery
2017

"Show me your cemeteries and I will tell you what kind of people you have."

- Benjamin Franklin
Cemetery Restoration Advisory Board

Brian Zets, Chair
David Cline
Mary Fee  (replaced Roger Chandler)
Nancy Ferguson
Denise Kohn
Katie Macchi
Bill Resch
Table of Contents

History of the New Albany Cemetery 4
Ohio Valley Archaeology's work 6
Recommendations for Monument Restoration, Replacement & Resetting 8
Recommendations for Cemetery Landscaping, Fencing, Signage and other Improvements 9
Recommendations for Monument Restoration and Ongoing Maintenance 10
Historic Site Designation 12
Cost estimates 12
Appendix 13
History of the New Albany Cemetery

The Village of New Albany was founded when William Yantis and Noble Landon platted it in 1837, although Noble Landon had previously established a post office here in 1836. The original plat for the town did not set aside land for a cemetery. At the time, there were several small burying grounds in the northern half of Plain Township and it was not uncommon for people to bury their deceased relatives on their properties (usually farms).

In 1854 and 1855, William Yantis, Jesse Kohn and Elizabeth Arnold sold small, adjacent sections of their lots to the Plain Township Trustees and a .568 acre cemetery was created for area residents. Yantis' first wife, Elizabeth, who died in 1849 and his son (by his second wife) who died in 1854, may have already been buried there at the time of the cemetery's formation. At least 9 other people buried in the cemetery died before the cemetery was formally created including Elizabeth Phelps (1851), Isabella Baum Robbins (1851), Luisa Ulry (1852) and Anna Benedict (1837). These individuals may have been buried on the Yantis, Kohn and Arnold properties or may have been reinterred from other burial spots after the cemetery was formed in 1854-1855.

The Village of New Albany was officially chartered in 1856.

Because of its proximity to the Rose Run Creek, the cemetery was plagued by flooding. In the early 2000s, Richard Yantis share that several caskets, including that of founder William Yantis, were exposed during one particularly bad flood many years earlier. Relatives then reinterred his casket to the Africa Cemetery in Delaware County, only to move it again when Alum Creek Reservoir was created and the Africa Cemetery was moved.

In addition to the flooding problems, there was no formal access to the cemetery without crossing the land of adjacent, private property owners. By the late 1870s, residents decided the area needed a larger, more accessible cemetery which was less prone to flooding.

In 1881, after the Township Trustees voted against creating a new cemetery, Maplewood Cemetery was formed as a private cemetery. A few years later, Maplewood was conveyed to the Plain Township Trustees. Maplewood Cemetery records indicate 58 people were reinterred from New Albany Cemetery to Maplewood Cemetery between 1881 and 1883.

Several exhaustive searches were made over the last 40 years, to find a comprehensive list of all the individuals interred in the New Albany Cemetery. Unfortunately, no comprehensive list appears to exist. In 1925, a map of the cemetery was prepared by the WPA as a part of a project to identify the location of veteran's graves throughout the county. Although the project resulted in a cemetery "map"
showing rows of gravesites and 692 burial plots, no individuals were identified or associated with any of the plots.

Although the New Albany Cemetery was initially owned by the Township Trustees, it eventually became surrounded by land within the corporate boundaries of New Albany and the responsibility for its maintenance legally transferred to the Village of New Albany.

A 1941 *Columbus Dispatch* article reported the New Albany Cemetery was scheduled for auction due to non-payment of property taxes. Charles F. Johnson, whose relatives were buried there, raised the $7.81 required to pay the delinquent taxes. The article also mentioned he had constructed a new fence around the cemetery a few years earlier.

In 1975, an adjacent property owner complained to the Township Trustees and the New Albany Village Council, that the New Albany Cemetery was not being maintained. Questions arose as to which entity was legally responsible for its maintenance. The Village Solicitor evidently concluded it was the Village’s responsibility. The minutes of a June 22, 1975 Council meeting note that the Solicitor suggested “ownership and control” could be taken over by the Township under current law. It was also suggested the Historical Society might like to own (and maintain) the cemetery. The Solicitor was directed to “study” these possibilities but, evidently, neither group wanted to volunteer to take on the responsibility.

The Village’s efforts to maintain the cemetery, must have remained minimal. A short time later, the disgruntled neighbor used a bulldozer to push most of the headstones into the adjacent Rose Run Creek in hopes of creating a pond. He covered the rest of the monuments with dirt. A few months later, Arloia Walton led a small group of volunteers to save the cemetery, including Glyde Marsh and Cecil Walton. The group cut the weeds and retrieved the headstones from the creek, piling them around the cemetery trees where they remained until 2016. The Walton and Curtis families continued to mow the cemetery for many years.

In 1979, the Franklin County Genealogical Society made a list of 25 headstones then located in the New Albany Cemetery along with a note stating, “Very few stones remain” and an indication that the cemetery was maintained by the Village of New Albany. That same year the Historical Society donated $175 and the Village contributed $800 to hire Carmine Menduni of Columbus Art Memorial to restore approximately 8 monuments. Since the original location of these monuments was not known, the monuments were reset in a row at the southeast corner of the cemetery. Sadly, some of these reset monuments were knocked down by vandals in approximately 2009.
Ohio Valley Archaeology’s Work

In the fall of 2015, New Albany City Council adopted Resolution R-45-2015: A RESOLUTION TO RESTORE THE “OLD BURIAL GROUNDS” AND CEMETERY MONUMENTS IN THE CITY OF NEW ALBANY. Pursuant to this resolution, the City of New Albany entered a contract with Ohio Valley Archaeology, Inc. to locate graves and headstones in the New Albany Cemetery, to determine where the cemetery fencing was originally located, to supervise excavation of buried headstones, to document all readable stones in the cemetery and to provide a final report summarizing its work.

The Resolution also established a Cemetery Restoration Advisory Board to assist and advise Council and the City Manager on matters related to the restoration of New Albany cemeteries and monuments.

In the spring of 2016, Ohio Valley Archaeology, Inc, under the leadership of Dr. Jarrod Burks and Dr. Albert M. Pecora, began an extensive study of the New Albany Cemetery. Among other accomplishments, OVAI mapped and documented cemetery features visible at the surface, located additional marker stones (monuments) through probing and excavation, conducted non-invasive surveys with a magnetometer and ground penetrating radar in an effort to identify unmarked graves and compiled a brief history of the cemetery with a list of those known to have been buried there.

A detailed surface map was made of the site using a laser transit and photogrammetric data created with drone-based aerial photos. Two trenches excavated with a backhoe, located evidence of at least three iterations of the cemetery perimeter fence. Between 63 and 83 “possible or probable” existing burial sites were identified through geophysical surveying and approximately 12 additional stone monuments were found, identifying individuals who had not previously been known to be buried in the cemetery.

Unexpectedly, the probing and subsequent excavations also found the foundation of a small building and documented 39 stone, rubble capped grave shafts, most of which are not associated with marker stones.

All of the stones (monuments), including those clustered around trees in the cemetery, were gathered up and moved to an off-site storage facility where they were washed, photographed and cataloged. Locations where the stones had been found, were identified and recorded with GPS coordinates. All inscriptions were recorded and included in OVAI’s report along with photos of the monuments.
Highlights of the OVAI's findings include:

*Up to 134 grave sites were probably in the New Albany Cemetery before reinterments began in the 1880s.

*58 people were reinterred from New Albany Cemetery to Maplewood Cemetery.

*63 – 83 sites in the New Albany Cemetery have been identified as "possible or probable" existing burial sites. Even more are possible since the northwest corner of the cemetery contains 20th century fill (rocks etc) which make it impossible for geophysical instruments or probing to reliably locate graves.

*68 people can be associated with the cemetery through headstones, footstones, previously documented stones which are now missing (per the 1979 list), and other historical references. These 68 people do not include any of the people who were reinterred in Maplewood Cemetery.

*56 stones (headstones and footstones) are in the possession of the City of New Albany and identify individuals with names and/or initials. Information is also available for 6 more stones which have become missing since the 1979 list was made by the Franklin County Genealogical Society. These 6 stones could be reproduced from the information available, and bring the total number of stones in the cemetery to 62.

*16 additional fragments were found which don't match the 56 stones with names or initials. Of these 16 fragments, at least 6 more interments could be indicated.

Electronic versions of Ohio Valley Archaeology's full report are available from Jennifer Mason, Clerk of Council, City of New Albany, Ohio.
Recommendations for Monument Restoration, Replacement and Resetting

Monuments (55), missing monuments (6) and fragments (16):

1) Monuments which are "intact" should be cleaned and reset in the New Albany Cemetery.

   In a few cases, the monument restorer can match up monuments which are broken at the bottom with fragments of monuments left in slots in the cemetery. The remaining monuments should be reset in approximately 4 groups throughout the cemetery, in locations which do not have an existing burial next to them. Existing "slots" should be re-used, where possible, and moved to a location not associated with an existing grave. Where no properly sized slot is available, a new slot should be made. (Up to 32 stones may fall into this category.)

2) Monuments which require repair, should be cleaned, repaired, and reset. Properly sized slots should be re-used, if available. If not available, new slots should be made. (Approximately 14 stones fit into this category.)

3) Monuments which cannot be repaired should be reproduced if sufficient information is available including the name of the deceased and a date of birth or date of death. The original monuments should be buried adjacent to the matching reproduction and a small plaque should identify where the original stone is buried. (Approximately 6 headstones fit into this category.)

4) The 6 missing monuments listed on the 1979 list prepared by the Franklin County Genealogical Society, should be reproduced using a simple design, and should be installed in locations with the other stones. (Approximately 6 monuments fit in this category.)

5) Foot stones or stones with just initials, should be matched up with headstones, where possible. Those stones with initials that do not match existing head stones should be randomly placed throughout the cemetery.

6) The 16 stone fragments with little or no identifying information should be mounted or imbedded on the back of the brick entrance feature wall, using limestone mortar so that they can be removed if necessary.
Recommendations for Cemetery Landscaping, Fencing, Signage and Other Improvements

1) Fencing: A new fence should be erected in the location of the original cemetery fence. The Cemetery Restoration Advisory Board recommends a wrought iron fence be erected with brick pillars breaking up the long expanses of wrought iron, similar to the fence surrounding Maplewood Cemetery. (See attachment).

The entrance to the cemetery should feature a brick wall approximately four feet high and incorporate the same brick pillars used throughout the cemetery perimeter fence.

A brick sidewalk should connect the parking lot to the cemetery. The dumpster should be moved to another area and one end of the sidewalk should join the parking lot near where the dumpster is currently located. The entrance to the cemetery should be located in an area which does not require people to walk over existing graves, at the entranceway. The sidewalk should be wide enough to accommodate 2 teak benches in an arrangement similar to the one which exists on the back of Village Hall.

2) Landscaping: Trees in the cemetery should be saved, if the tree is healthy and does not protrude into the fence line. Large stumps should be removed or cut below ground level. Small boxwood hedges and flower beds should be added in a manner that does not block signage on the wall in future years.

3) Signage/Website: A large bronze historic marker (similar to the one at the Ealy House) should be installed at the entrance to, or in the interior of, the cemetery. New Albany’s Planners should be consulted to determine the final location. The bronze marker should explain the history of the cemetery, the fact it is a New Albany historic site and the fact that the headstones are not in their original locations, in most cases. It should also describe the destruction of the cemetery and indicate it was restored in 2017.

Additional bronze plaques should be installed on the entrance feature wall, on either side of the entrance, identifying 1) the name of the cemetery and very brief information about its history (years it was in use and the year it was restored etc). 2) A list of all people known to be buried in the cemetery along with the year of birth and/or death, as available. An asterisk can be added next to names of people whose monument is thought to be in its original location.

A small sign should be mounted outside the cemetery referring visitors to the city’s website for more information. This sign may need adjusting as technology changes.

New Albany’s website should include a more detailed history of the cemetery including information about its vandalism and restoration. It should also include the names of the 68 people currently believed to be buried there and any biographical information available for them. (CRAB members and
members of the Historical Society may be able to assist in obtaining this information.) The website should also include the names of the 58 people known to have been buried in the cemetery and later reinterred in Maplewood and information about William Yantis's reinterment to the Africa Cemetery. A copy of Ohio Valley Archaeology's Report and the Cemetery Restoration Advisory Board's Report and Recommendation, should also be included on the website.

On the interior of the brick wall, bronze signage should include a list of Council members, staff members and the CRAB members involved with the restoration.

4) Flagpole- A flagpole should be located near the center of the cemetery, similar to the flagpoles at the Wagnor Cemetery and the Smith Burial Grounds.

5) Security- Security cameras should be installed on the Police Station garage so the Dispatchers can monitor any activity in the cemetery. Other security features should be considered, such as motion detectors near the entrance.

Recommendations for Monument Restoration and Ongoing Maintenance

The Cemetery Restoration Advisory Board recommends the restoration of these monuments be completed by a professional trained by the National Parks Service's NCPTT (National Center for Preservation Technology and Training) or by a professional who follows these standards for proper monument maintenance and repair.

After the monuments are restored, the Cemetery Restoration Advisory Board recommends the City of New Albany follow the guidelines for cemetery monument maintenance and repair described by the NCPTT, or that it hire properly qualified professionals to do the work according to NCPTT guidelines.

Recommendations for Future Maintenance:

1) Grass within New Albany's cemeteries should be mowed weekly during growing season. If large commercial mowers are used, they should only be used in areas which have no monuments. Only the smaller, residential lawn mowers and weed wackers should be used adjacent to the monuments. Any monuments which topple over, should be leaned upright as soon as discovered so they are not "run over" by the commercial lawn mowers.

2) Each year, an inspection should be made to determine the number of monuments in the cemeteries which need cleaning and/or repair. Repairs should be made on an annual basis, if not more often. The City of New
Albany should contract with professional monument restoration experts to clean, repair and restore monuments, if funding is available.

3) The City of New Albany should "title" a separate account in the Service Department's budget for cemetery monument restoration and repair, and should budget each year for repair, replacement and resetting of stones in its two cemeteries, the NB Cemetery and the Wagner Cemetery.

4) Should the City staff undertake cleaning and/or restoring monuments "in house", reference should be made to the guidelines set forth by the National Park Service's National Center for Preservation Technology and Training (NCPTT) for information about best practices. The NCPTT is the agency of the Federal government responsible for maintaining and restoring all of the national monuments throughout the country. (https://www.ncptt.nps.gov/articles/cemetery-conservation/).

If possible, a City staff member should be sent to one of the NCPTT's training sessions, offered at many locations throughout the United States. https://www.ncptt.nps.gov/training-conferences-events/

5) Staff members should make sure that no power tools (including power drills, wire brushes, Nylox wheels or power washers) are used in monument maintenance. No soap, detergents, bleach, peroxide, ammonia or chemicals should be used with the exception of D/2 Biological Solution. (D/2 Biological Solution has been used on over 3.5 million headstones maintained by the Department of Veterans Affairs and has been proved to be the best product for cleaning stones while maintaining them.) "Wet and Forget" should never be used as it can cause long term damage to the stone.

Limestone mortar should be used to reattach stones to their "slots" (bases), rather than concrete which frequently damages monuments after a freeze. Concrete can be used to replace foundations, but stone monuments should never be allowed to come in direct contact with concrete. Limestone mortar should be placed between them. Tamped down crushed stone should also be used beneath newly set monuments to keep the "slot" or stone monument from sinking.

For additional information on cleaning monuments, see:

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VEVzUo26ANY
Historic Site Designation

New Albany City Council should designate the New Albany Cemetery as a local Historic Site and include information about the same on the bronze historic marker located in the New Albany Cemetery.

Cost Estimates

For Cleaning, Repair, and Resetting of Existing Monuments:
To clean and reset approximately 32 stones currently being stored by the City of New Albany. Also, to repair, clean and reset approximately 14 additional stones, match stones with any stone fragments remaining in "slots", and create new "slots" where necessary................................................................. $14,000

For Replacing and Resetting Missing and Damaged Monuments:
To replace 6 missing stones and reset them. Also, to reproduce and reset an additional 6 stones which cannot be repaired. .........................$6000-$12,000

(The cost of making each monument varies with the amount of detail and lettering on each stone, but we anticipate the total cost of replacing these 12 stones will be approximately $9000.)

For fencing, landscaping, entrance wall, sidewalk and benches, historical marker, signage, website additions, flagpole and security features:
Estimates for these items will be provided by MKSK and the city planning staff.
Monument pieces reunited

A "slot" is uncovered

Repaired monuments (Granville)

Before

After

Monuments cleaned with D/2 Solution

Conceptual drawing - NA cemetery

Conceptual drawing - NA cemetery
Fence at Maplewood Cemetery

Historic Marker & flag at Wagnor Cemetery

Worthington- entrance wall & walk

Worthington- stones embedded in wall

Smith cemetery- (Johnstown Rd at Clouse)
RESOLUTION R-__-2017

A RESOLUTION TO FUND THE RESTORATION OF THE NEW ALBANY CEMETERY, TO ADOPT GUIDELINES FOR MAINTENANCE AND RESTORATION OF CEMETERY MONUMENTS, AND TO DESIGNATE THE NEW ALBANY CEMETERY AS A LOCAL HISTORIC LANDMARK.

WHEREAS, on October 20, 2015, Council adopted Resolution R-45-2015 to create a Cemetery Restoration Advisory Board, to study the conditions of New Albany's cemeteries and make recommendations to Council for their restoration and preservation, and

WHEREAS, on November 17th, 2015 Council adopted Resolution R-52-2015 in which it affirmed its desire to restore the New Albany Cemetery and hire Ohio Valley Archaeology to perform certain work there, and

WHEREAS, Ohio Valley Archaeology, Inc has completed its work in the New Albany Cemetery and issued a report entitled “Rediscovering the New Albany Cemetery: Results of Recent Archaeological Investigations in a 19th Century Cemetery in New Albany, Ohio”, and

WHEREAS, the Cemetery Restoration Advisory Board has recently completed its Report and Recommendation concerning the restoration of the New Albany Cemetery and its cemetery monuments, and has presented it to Council for its review.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Council of the City of New Albany, Counties of Franklin and Licking, State of Ohio, that:

Section 1: The City Manager is hereby authorized and directed to contract with a professional monument restorer to clean, repair, and reset approximately 46 stone cemetery monuments for a cost not to exceed $15,000.

Section 2: The City Manager is hereby authorized and directed to contract with a professional monument manufacturer to replace 12 cemetery monuments which are missing or not restorable, at a cost not to exceed $12,000.
Section 3: The City Manager is hereby authorized and directed to make certain other improvements to the New Albany Cemetery grounds as recommended by the Cemetery Restoration Advisory Board in its report issued in April 2017.

Section 4: The City of New Albany hereby adopts certain standards and guidelines for the restoration and maintenance of its historic monuments and cemeteries, as set forth on pages 10 and 11 of the “Cemetery Restoration Advisory Board Report and Recommendation” issued in April, 2017.

Section 5: The City of New Albany hereby designates the New Albany Cemetery to be a local Historic Landmark in the city of New Albany.

Section 6: It is hereby found and determined that all formal actions of this Council concerning and relating to the passage of this resolution were adopted in an open meeting of the council and that all deliberations of this council and any decision making bodies of the City of New Albany which resulted in such formal actions were in meetings open to the public and in compliance with all legal requirements of the City of New Albany, Counties of Franklin and Licking, Ohio.

Section 7: This resolution shall take effect and be in force at the earliest period allowed by law.

CERTIFIED AS ADOPTED this ______ day of _____________, 2017.

ATTEST:

Sloan Spalding
Mayor

Jennifer Mason
Clerk of Council