







| SC-1 |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Material | Manufacturer | Color Name | Code |
| Shingles | Certainteed | Moire Black |  |
| Windows | Jeld-Wen | Black |  |
| Garage Door | Wayne Dalton - Steel 9100 Series | White |  |
| Primary Siding - LP Lap / Board \& Batten | Sherwin Williams | Needlepoint Navy | SW0032 |
| Sliding Accent Areas - LP Lap / Board \& Batten | Sherwin Williams | Dutch Tile Blue | SW0050 |
| Front Door | Sherwin Williams | SW0031 |  |
| Trim \& Fypon Accents | Sherwin Williams | Classic Light Buff | SW0050 |
| Gutters \& Downspouts | Union Corrugating Company | Black |  |
| Metal Roofs | Union Corrugating Company | Black |  |
| Aluminum Fencing | 4' Tall - Front \& Sides | White |  |
| Vinyl Fencing | USA Vinyl - 6' Privacy |  |  |


| SC-2 |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Material | Manufacturer | Color Name | Code |
| Shingles | Certainteed | Moire Black |  |
| Windows | Jlack |  |  |
| Garage Door | Wayne Dalton-Wen - Steel 9100 Series | White |  |
| Primary Siding - LP Lap / Board \& Batten | Sherwin Williams | Classic French Gray | SW0077 |
| Siding Accent Areas - LP Lap / Board \& Batten | Sherwin Williams | Classic Light Buff | SW0050 |
| Front Door | Sherwin Williams | Rookwood Shutter Green | SW2809 |
| Trim \& Fypon Accents | Sherwin Williams | Classic Light Buff | SW0050 |
| Gutters \& Downspouts | Union Corrugating Company | White |  |
| Metal Roofs | Union Corrugating Company | Black |  |
| Aluminum Fencing | 4' Tall - Front \& Sides | Black |  |
| Vinyl Fencing | USA Vinyl - 6' Privacy | White |  |


| SC-3 |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Material | Manufacturer | Color Name |  |
| Code |  |  |  |
| Shingles | Certainteed | Moire Black |  |
| Windows | Jeld-Wen | Black |  |
| Garage Door | Wayne Dalton - Steel 9100 Series | White |  |
| Primary Siding - LP Lap / Board \& Batten | Sherwin Williams | Classic Light Buff |  |
| Siding Accent Areas - LP Lap / Board \& Batten | Sherwin Williams | SW0050 |  |
| Front Door | Sherwin Williams | Westchester Gray |  |
| Trim \& Fypon Accents | Sherwin Williams | SW2849 |  |
| Gutters \& Downspouts | Union Corrugating Company | Classic Light Buff | SWhite |
| Metal Roofs | Union Corrugating Company | Black |  |
| Aluminum Fencing | 4' Tall - Front \& Sides | Black |  |
| Vinyl Fencing | USA Vinyl - 6' Privacy | White |  |


| SC-4 |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Material | Manufacturer | Color Name | Code |
| Shingles | Certainteed | Moire Black |  |
| Windows | Jeld-Wen | Black |  |
| Garage Door | Wayne Dalton - Steel 9100 Series | White |  |
| Primary Siding - LP Lap / Board \& Batten | Sherwin Williams | Westchester Gray | SW2849 |
| Siding Accent Areas - LP Lap / Board \& Batten | Sherwin Williams | Classic Light Buff | SW0050 |
| Front Door | Sherwin Williams | Needlepoint Navy | SW0032 |
| Trim \& Fypon Accents | Sherwin Williams | Classic Light Buff | SW0050 |
| Gutters \& Downspouts | Union Corrugating Company | White |  |
| Metal Roofs | Union Corrugating Company | Black |  |
| Aluminum Fencing | 4' Tall - Front \& Sides | Black |  |
| Vinyl Fencing | USA Vinyl - 6' Privacy | White |  |

Sherwin-Williams. HOMESCAPES ${ }^{\text {™ }}$

## Epcon New Albany Schemes

## Farmhouse Scheme 1

| 1 | Body | SW 0032 Needlepoint Navy | Brick |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 2 | Secondary Body | SW 2821 Downing Stone |  |
| 3 | Trim | SW 0050 Classic Light Buff |  |
| 4 | Door | SW 0031 Dutch Tile Blue |  |
|  | Metal Roof | Black |  |
|  | Roof Shingle | Black |  |
|  | Windows | Black |  |
|  | Gutters \& Downspouts | Graphite |  |
|  | Porch Railings | Black |  |
|  | Garage Door | White |  |

## SherWin-Williams. HOMESCAPES ${ }^{\text {TM }}$

## Epcon New Albany Schemes



## Farmhouse Scheme 2

| 1 | Body | SW 0077 Classic French Gray |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 2 | Secondary Body | SW 0023 Pewter Tankard |
| 3 | Trim | SW 0050 Classic Light Buff |
| 4 | Door | SW 2809 Rookwood Shutter Green |
| Metal Roof | Black |  |
| Roof Shingle | Black |  |
| Windows | Black |  |
| Gutters \& Downspouts | White |  |
| Porch Railings | White |  |
| Garage Door | White | Dover White |
| Color samples shown approximate actual paint colors as closely as possible. 23-01-0747 3/15/2023 |  |  |

Sherwin-Williams. HOMESCAPES ${ }^{\text {M }}$

## Epcon New Albany Schemes

## Farmhouse Scheme 3

1 Body
2 Secondary Body
3 Trim
4 Door
Metal Roof
Roof Shingle
Windows
Gutters \& Downspouts
Porch Railings
Garage Door

SW 0050 Classic Light Buff SW 0050 Classic Light Buff

SW 0050 Classic Light Buff
SW 2849 Westchester Gray
Black
Black
Black
White
White
White

Brick Dover White


EPCON

Sherwin-Williams. HOMESCAPES ${ }^{\text {™ }}$

## Epcon New Albany Schemes



## Farmhouse Scheme 4



Shingles

## Trim \& Windows



## H Historic Color <br> SW 0032 <br> Needlepoint Navy

FULL DETAILS $\vee$

H Historic Color
SW 0031

## Dutch Tile Blue

```
FULL DETAILS V
```

H Historic Color
SW 0050
Classic Light Buff
FULL DETAILS $\vee$


## H Historic Color <br> SW 0077 <br> Classic French Gray

## H Historic Color <br> SW 0050 <br> Classic Light Buff

 FULL DETAILS $\vee$H Historic Color
sw 2809
Rookwood Shutter Green fULL details $\vee$

H Historic Color
SW 0050

## Classic Light Buff

FULL DETAILS $\vee$

## Trim \& Windows

H Historic Color
SW 0050

## Classic Light Buff



H Historic Color
SW 0050
Classic Light Buff
FULL DETAILS $\vee$

H Historic Color
SW 0050
Classic Light Buff
FULL DETAILS $\vee$

Shingles

## Trim \& Windows

H Historic Color
SW 0050

## Classic Light Buff



```
SW 2849
Westchester Gray
Interior / Exterior
```

```
H Historic Color
sw 0032
Needlepoint Navy
```

fULL DETAILS

H Historic Color
SW 0050
Classic Light Buff
FULL DETAILS $\vee$


Modular Brick
"Dover White" With White
Mortar \& Brown Sand

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Options
Mullion ..... 2
Divided Lite Options .....  3
Trim Options ..... 4
Grille Patterns ..... 5
Clear Opening Layout ..... 6
Section Details
Standard Unit Sections:
PG20 - Horizontal Section ..... 7
PG20 w/ 4 9/16" Jamb Extender - Horizontal Section ..... 8
PG20 w/ 6 9/16" Jamb Extender - Horizontal Section ..... 9
PG50 - Horizontal Section ..... 10
PG20 w/ Cam Lock - Vertical Section ..... 11
PG50 w/ Cam Lock - Vertical Section ..... 12
PG20 w/ Wenlock - Vertical Section ..... 13
PG50 w/ Wenlock - Vertical Section ..... 14
PG20 Pocket - Horizontal Section ..... 15
PG50 Pocket - Horizontal Section ..... 16
PG20 w/ Cam Lock Pocket - Vertical Section ..... 17
PG50 w/ Cam Lock Pocket - Vertical Section ..... 18
PG20 w/ Wenlock Pocket - Vertical Section ..... 19
PG50 w/ Wenlock Pocket - Vertical Section ..... 20
PG20 Twin - Horizontal Section ..... 21
PG50 Twin - Horizontal Section ..... 22
PG20 3 Wide - Horizontal Section ..... 23
PG50 3 Wide - Horizontal Section ..... 24
Bay \& Bow Units - Vertical Section ..... 25
Bay Units:
$30^{\circ}$ - Horizontal Section ..... 26
$45^{\circ}$ - Horizontal Section ..... 27
Bows Units:
3 Wide $10^{\circ}$ - Horizontal Section ..... 28
4 Wide $10^{\circ}$ - Horizontal Section ..... 29
5 Wide $10^{\circ}$ - Horizontal Section ..... 30


Tilt SH Mulled To Tilt SH
1/2" Clip


Slider Mulled To Tilt SH
1 9/16" Clip


Tilt SH Mulled To Tilt SH 15/16" Clip


Tilt SH Mulled To Tilt SH
19/16" Clip


Tilt SH Mulled To Tilt SH
2 7/16" Clip


7/8" Low Profile Contour SDL


5/8" Flat GBG


1" Raised Slim SDL


7/8" Flat GBG


1" Raised Slim SDL w/ Shadowbar


5/8" Contour GBG


Florida Flange



Prairie Glass


Colonial Top Down


Colonial Top Sash


| Clear Opening Formulas <br> Clear Opening Width | Clear Opening Height |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Tilt Single Hung PG20 | Frame Width $-2.813^{\prime \prime}$ | (Frame Height $/ 2)-3.345^{\prime \prime}$ |
| Tilt Single Hung PG35/50 | Frame Width $-2.813^{\prime \prime}$ | (Frame Height / 2) - $3.885^{\prime \prime}$ |

## PG20 - HORIZONTAL SECTION





## PG50 - HORIZONTAL SECTION







## PG20 POCKET - HORIZONTAL SECTION















NOTES:

1. Dimensional details available upon ordering
2. Fixed window frame shown, other frames available

## $30^{\circ}$ BAY - HORIZONTAL SECTION



## NOTES:

1. Dimensional details available upon ordering
2. Jamb Depths available in $49 / 16$ " and $69 / 16 "$
3. Picture frame shown for center window, tilt single hung frame with track filler also available
4. Fixed center window shown, operating center window available


NOTES:

1. Dimensional details available upon ordering
2. Jamb Depths available in $49 / 16$ " and $69 / 16 "$
3. Picture frame shown for center window, tilt single hung frame with track filler also available
4. Fixed center window shown, operating center window available

## 3 WIDE $10^{\circ}$ BOW - HORIZONTAL SECTION



NOTES:

1. Dimensional details available upon ordering
2. Jamb Depths available in $49 / 16$ " and 6 9/16"
3. Picture frame shown, other frames available

## 4 WIDE $10^{\circ}$ BOW - HORIZONTAL SECTION



NOTES:

1. Dimensional details available upon ordering
2. Jamb Depths available in $49 / 16^{\prime \prime}$ and $69 / 16^{\prime \prime}$
3. Picture frame shown, other frames available


NOTES:

1. Dimensional details available upon ordering
2. Jamb Depths available in 4 9/16" and $69 / 16^{\prime \prime}$
3. Picture frame shown, other frames available



# A RESTRICTED USE APPRAISAL OF FEE SIMPLE VALUE PARKLAND CONTRIBUTION COURTYARD AT HAINES CREEK HYPOTHETICAL 3.36 AC TRACT ROCKY FORK METRO PARK AREA NEW ALBANY <br> FRANKLIN COUNTY, OH 

A Restricted Use Appraisal Of<br>Fee Simple Value<br>Parkland Contribution<br>Courtyard at Haines Creek<br>Hypothetical 3.36 AC Tract<br>Rocky Fork Metro Park Area<br>New Albany<br>Franklin County, OH



FOR:
Mr. Jason Coffee
VP Land Development
Epcon Communities
500 Stonehenge Parkway
Dublin, Ohio 43017

BY:
Horner Appraisal Group, Inc.
185 North High Street
Suite B
Columbus, Ohio 43215

# Horner Appraisal Group, Inc. <br> REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS AND CONSULTANTS 

 185 NORTH HIGH STREET, SUITE BCOLUMBUS, OHIO 43215
James R. Horner, MAI
TEL. 614/246-8383

October 20, 2023

Mr. Jason Coffee
VP Land Development
Epcon Communities
500 Stonehenge Parkway
Dublin, Ohio 43017

Re: A Restricted Use Appraisal Of
Fee Simple Value
Parkland Contribution
Courtyard at Haines Creek
Hypothetical 3.36 AC Tract
Rocky Fork Metro Park Area
New Albany
Franklin County, OH

Dear Mr. Coffee,
Pursuant to your request and in accordance with your directives, we are providing an estimate of value of a hypothetical 3.36 AC tract within the vicinity of the Rocky Fork Metro Park, Plain Township, Franklin County, OH.

This neighborhood is bordered on the south by New Albany, on the north by Delaware County, on the east by Bevelhymer Road and Licking County, and on the west by Rocky Fork Creek and the Corporation Limits of the City of Columbus. The Intended Use of this Report is to determine the approximate Market Value of a 3.36 AC tract within this region of Greater Columbus. The general parameters of the valuation would be as follows:

- Acreage Values vs. Small Residential Homesites
- No access to "wet" utilities (i.e., sewer)
- Zoned Rural
- Not within a Flood Zone or Floodway area

The Intended Use of this Report is to determine the value of this type of land, as it relates to the proposed donation of a contribution relating to a Proposed Epcon Project that is to be developed within New Albany. The value of the donation is based upon the value of 3.36 AC that could be assembled or used in conjunction with the areas abutting or near the Rocky Fork Metro Park.

The Intended Users of this Report are officials of Epcon Communities and Council Members and officials of New Albany.

This Report is being submitted as a Restricted Report, the outline of which is included within the Addendum.

Based upon the parameters set forth herein, it is our opinion that the value of a Hypothetical 3.36 AC tract, within this designated area and with these types of physical and legal characteristics, would have a Market Value at or near $\$ 50 \mathrm{~K} / \mathrm{AC}$. Applying this to the hypothetical 3.36 AC would indicate a Market Value, in terms of financial arrangements equivalent to cash, as of the most recent visitation date of the area, October 20, 2023, of $\$ 168,000$.

## ONE HUNDRED SIXTY-EIGHT THOUSAND DOLLARS

## (\$168,000)

Allocated:
\$50K/AC

In addition to the Comparable Sales set forth herein, the Appraisers are aware of negotiations currently underway between officials of New Albany and/or the Metropolitan Park Board for acquiring additional land within the area of the intersection of Peter Hoover and Fancher Roads within the extreme northeast quadrant of Franklin County, which would be assembled with Bevelhymer Park. These negotiations, as well as the Comparables set forth herein, provide strong support for the value of parkland within the Rocky Fork Metro Park neighborhood at \$50K/AC.

The most recent Sale, \#1022, is a tract that was appraised by the Horner Appraisal Group for this City of New Albany and reflects an effective purchase price at or near $\$ 60 \mathrm{~K} / \mathrm{AC}$; however, this includes the owner's opinion of the value of $\$ 550 \mathrm{~K}$. The Appraisers have had knowledge in regard to this property, and the stated purchase price requires a downward adjustment for "circumstances".

Additional Sales are included herein.
The Appraisers hereby certify that they have no present or future contemplative interest in the valuation involved in this assignment.

We certify this Report is within the scope of our certification, not contingent upon any fee and is provided by ourselves as disinterested and unbiased third parties. The Appraisers have visited the property and have concurred in the valuation and analysis.

The Appraisers wish to acknowledge the assistance of Ms. Amy Roberts in the preparation of this document.

Thank you for this opportunity to be of service.

Sincerely,


GA Certification \#380744


JRH/acr

| PARK LAND |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| QUAD: | 2 |
| TAXING DISTRICT: | 220 |
| PARCEL NUMBER: | 000205, 001355 |
| LOCATION: | Bevelhymer Rd, NWC Walnut |
|  | Plain Tshp OH 43054 |
| GRANTOR: | Wallaby Properties LLC James Reid |
| GRANTEE: | New Albany City |
|  | 99 W Main Street, New Albany, OH 614-939-2254 |
| SALE PRICE: | \$4,400,000 |
| SALE DATE: | 1/10/2023 |
| SITE | 73.66 |
|  | rural |
| DEED REFERENCE: | 202301100002855 |
| FINANCING: | Cash to seller |
|  |  |
| COMMENTS: |  |
| PRICE/SF | \$1.37 |
| PRICE/ACRE | \$59,734 |

TAXING DISTRICT: 220
PARCEL NUMBER: 000205, 001355

99 W Main Street, New Albany, OH
614-939-2254
SALE PRICE: $\quad \$ 4,400,000$
SALE DATE: $\quad 1 / 10 / 2023$
SITE
73.66
rural

Cash to seller
$\$ 0$
COMMENTS:

PRICE/SF
$\$ 59,734$

## The Columbus Rispatch

NEW ALBANY

## New Allbany to donate land to Rocky Fork Metro Park

## Gary Seman Jr. ThisWeek

Pubilshed 11:41 a.m. ET Dec. 14, 2022 | Updated 1:37 p.m. ET Dec. 14, 2022
The city of New Albany is donating a piece of land to the Rocky Fork Metro Park.
City Council on Dec. 13 approved a resolution authorizing the city manager to purchase two parcels, totaling roughly 74 acres, from Wallaby Properties, LLC.

Both properties are located in Plain Township, adjacent to the northwest corner of the intersection of Bevelhymer Road and Walnut Street,

The city is to spend $\$ 3.85$ million cash for the parcel, while the asking price is $\$ 4.4$ million. The seller intends to declare the $\$ 550,000$ difference between the purchase price and cash amount as a charitable donation.
"We have set aside money to purchase additional acreage in order to grow Rocky Fork Metro Park," said Scott McAfee, spokesperson for the city of New Albany.
"The metro park itself is already 1,200 acres, so there are already a lot of components that are in that metro park."

New Albany will donate some of the acreage to the Rocky Fork Metro Park, although it is unclear how much, McAfee said.

The city has reached out to Columbus and Franklin County Metro Parks to see if the system would be interested in purchasing some of the land but no deal has been struck.

It also is not known what should become of the remainder of the land once a portion of it is donated, McAfee said.

The park features more than 3 miles of walking trails, a bridle park, a dog park, an off-leash trail for dogs, a play area for kids, a large shelter and observation areas.

New Albany has spent up to $\$ 4$ million on the park, part of the Columbus and Franklin County Metro Parks, which opened in 2015.

Joe Stefanov, city manager of New Albany, said no amenities are planned on the site for the time being.
"We foresee it being for the future expansion of the metro park," Stefanov said. "I guess it really just depends on what we end up deciding to do with the land (in collaboration with) our community partners."

The parcels are located within the park zone in the New Albany Strategic Plan. They also are located within the city of Columbus' growth zone, as defined in the annexation agreement between the cities of New Albany and Columbus.

The parceis are being acquired for the purpose of enhancing the Rocky Fork Metro Park, facilitating the growth of the New Albany Joint Park District and managing residential growth and student population.

The site is outside of the New Albany growth zone and can't be annexed to the city of New Albany. For now, it has no access to public utilities, Stefanov said.
"If it was annexed into Columbus, then any of the kids who would be generated by residential development in that area would have to go the Columbus public-school system," he said.
"If it remains in the township, they would go to New Albany school district."
gseman@thisweeknews.com
@ThisWeekGary


| DEVELOPMENT LAND |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| QUAD: | 2 |
| TAXING DISTRICT: | 110 |
| PARCEL NUMBER: | 003005 |
| LOCATION: | Ulry Rd, N of Warner Rd |
|  | Westerville OH 43081 |
| GRANTOR: | Daniel \& Amy Moore |
| GRANTEE: | Lamb of God Evangelical Lutheran |
|  | David Chen |
|  | 4925 Sunbury Rd, Columbus, OH |
|  | 614-471-5164 |
| SALE PRICE: | \$380,000 |
| SALE DATE: | 8/3/2022 |
| SITE | 6.192 |
|  | R1 |
| DEED REFERENCE: | 202208040112906 |
| FINANCING: | Cash to seller |
|  | \$0 |
| COMMENTS: | For construction of a church. |
| PRICE/SF | \$1.41 |
| PRICE/ACRE | \$61,370 |



| QUAD: | 2 |
| :---: | :---: |
| TAXING DISTRICT: | 010 |
| PARCEL NUMBER: | 302730 |
| LOCATION: | Walnut St, W of Harlem |
|  | Westerville OH 43081 |
| GRANTOR: | The Souder Family Trust |
|  | James Souder |
| GRANTEE: | M/I Homes of Central Ohio |
|  | 4131 Worth Avenue, Columbus, OH 614-379-4044 |
| SALE PRICE: | \$2,000,000 |
| SALE DATE: | 6/15/2021 |
| SITE | 41.111 |
|  | PUD4 |
| DEED REFERENCE: | 202106160105165 |
| FINANCING: | Cash to seller |
|  | \$0 |
| COMMENTS: | Split from parcel 010-267724. |
| PRICE/SF | \$1.12 |
| PRICE/ACRE | \$48,649 |




TAXING DISTRICT: 010

- 301106-7

Walnut St, E of Lee Rd
Westerville OH 43081
GRANTOR: Phillips Farm LLC
Jonathan Wilcox
M/I Homes of Central Ohio

3 Easton Oval \#300, Columbus, OH
614-418-4000
SALE PRICE: \$2,616,600
SALE DATE: 6/1/2020
SITE 44.717
PUD6

DEED REFERENCE: 202006030076796
FINANCING: Cash to seller
\$0

PRICE/ACRE $\$ 58,515$


| QUAD: | 2 |
| :---: | :---: |
| TAXING DISTRICT: | 111 |
| PARCEL NUMBER: | 298998 |
| LOCATION: | Walnut St, W of Lee |
|  | Westerville OH 43081 |
| GRANTOR: | Daryl \& Teresa Vesner |
| GRANTEE: | M/I Homes of Central Ohio |
|  | 3 Easton Oval, Columbus, OH 614-418-4000 |
| SALE PRICE: | \$1,633,118 |
| SALE DATE: | 11/1/2019 |
| SITE | 31.107 |
|  | R1 |
| DEED REFERENCE: | 201911010146090 |
| FINANCING: | Cash to seller |
|  | \$0 |
| COMMENTS: |  |
| PRICE/SF | \$1.21 |
| PRICE/ACRE | \$52,500 |



| QUAD: | 2 |
| :---: | :---: |
| TAXING DISTRICT: | 111 |
| PARCEL NUMBER: | 298021 |
| LOCATION: | Ulry Rd, S of Lee Rd |
|  | Blendon Tshp OH 43081 |
| GRANTOR: | McCorkle Soaring Eagles LLC |
|  | Naomi McCorkle |
| GRANTEE: | C\&Y Properties of Big Walnut |
|  | Joseph Ciminello |
|  | c/o Greenlawn Co, 555 Greenlawn Ave, Columbus, OH |
|  | 614-443-7421 |
| SALE PRICE: | \$1,625,000 |
| SALE DATE: | 4/23/2019 |
| SITE | 30.338 |
|  | R1 |
| DEED REFERENCE: | 201904230046321 |
| FINANCING: | Cash to seller |
|  | \$0 |
| COMMENTS: |  |
| PRICE/SF | \$1.23 |
| PRICE/ACRE | \$53,563 |



| QUAD: | 2 |
| :---: | :---: |
| TAXING DISTRICT: | 220 |
| PARCEL NUMBER: | 000061 |
| LOCATION: | Babbitt Rd, S of SR 161 |
|  | New Albany OH 43054 |
| GRANTOR: | Kathleen Pollock |
| GRANTEE: | New Albany Company |
|  | Brent Bradbury |
|  | 8000 Walton Pkwy, New Albany, OH |
|  | 614-989-3000 |
| SALE PRICE: | \$950,000 |
| SALE DATE: | 7/7/2021 |
| SITE | 19.791 |
|  | Rural |
| DEED REFERENCE: | 202107070118259 |
| FINANCING: | Cash to seller |
|  | \$0 |
| COMMENTS: |  |
| PRICE/S- | \$1.10 |
| PRICE/ACRE | \$48,002 |



| QUAD: | 2 |
| :---: | :---: |
| TAXING DISTRICT: | 220 |
| PARCEL NUMBER: | 000446, 000190 |
| LOCATION: | Babbitt Rd, S of SR 161 |
|  | New Albany OH 43054 |
| GRANTOR: | Willard B Zarley Trust Pamela S Zarley-Snyder |
| GRANTEE: | New Albany Company <br> Brent Bradbury <br> 8000 Walton Pkwy, New Albany, OH $614-989-3000$ |
| SALE PRICE: | \$1,000,000 |
| SALE DATE: | 7/26/2021 |
| SITE | 22.2 <br> Rural |
| DEED REFERENCE: | 202107270131651 |
| FINANCING: | Cash to seller \$0 |
| COMMENTS: |  |
| PRICE/SF | \$1.03 |
| PRICE/ACRE | \$45,045 |



| QUAD: | 2 |
| :---: | :---: |
| TAXING DISTRICT: | 220 |
| PARCEL NUMBER: | 000178, 002049 |
| LOCATION: | Babbitt Rd, S of SR 161 |
|  | New Albany OH 43054 |
| GRANTOR: | Baker Heritage Trust Mary Jordan |
| GRANTEE: | New Albany Company <br> Brent Bradbury <br> 8000 Walton Pkwy, New Albany, OH 614-939-8000 |
| SALE PRICE: | \$1,689,333 |
| SALE DATE: | 8/4/2021 |
| SITE | 39.937 |
| ZONING: | Rural |
| DEED REFERENCE: | 202108040138140 |
| FINANCING: | Cash to seller |
|  | \$0 |
| COMMENTS: |  |
| PRICE/SF | \$0.97 |
| PRICE/ACRE | \$42,300 |



| QUAD: | 2 |
| :---: | :---: |
| TAXING DISTRICT: | 220 |
| PARCEL NUMBER: | 000437 |
| LOCATION: | Walnut St, E of NewAICon |
|  | New Albany OH 43054 |
| GRANTOR: | Diane Frazier \& Nance Whittingham |
| GRANTEE: | Coughlin Investments Ltd <br> Albert Coughlin <br> PO box 1474, Pataskala, OH <br> 614-374-1448 |
| SALE PRICE: | \$1,561,350 |
| SALE DATE: | 12/1/2020 |
| SITE | 37.175 |
|  | Rural |
| DEED REFERENCE: | 202012020191296 |
| FINANCING: | Cash to seller |
|  | \$0 |
| COMMENTS: |  |
| PRICE/SF | \$0.96 |
| PRICE/ACRE | \$42,000 |



| QUAD: | 2 |
| :---: | :---: |
| TAXING DISTRICT: | 010 |
| PARCEL NUMBER: | 302731, 267724 |
| LOCATION: | Walnut St, W of Harlem |
|  | Westerville OH 43081 |
| GRANTOR: | The Souder Family Trust |
|  | James Souder |
| GRANTEE: | Walnut Land Holding LLC |
|  | Joseph Ciminello |
|  | c/o Ciminello Landscape, 567 Lazelle Rd, Columbus, OH |
|  | 614-885-3779 |
| SALE PRICE: | \$1,555,000 |
| SALE DATE: | 6/15/2021 |
| SITE | 40.711 |
|  | PUD4 |
| DEED REFERENCE: | 202106160105166 |
| FINANCING: | Cash to seller |
|  | \$0 |
| COMMENTS: | Transferred 39.213 acres split from 010-267724 and the balance of 010267724. |
| PRICE/SF | \$0.88 |
| PRICE/ACRE | \$38,196 |



| RURAL LAND |  |
| :--- | :--- |
| QUAD: | 2 |
| TAXING DISTRICT: | 220 |
| PARCEL NUMBER: | 000283 |
| LOCATION: | Bevelhymer, S of county In <br> Westerville OH |
|  |  |
| GRANTOR: | Paul Doran |
|  |  |
| GRANTEE: | Joshua \& Courtney Beckner |
|  | 5256 Sugar Run, New Albany, OH |
|  | $614-745-7702$ |
| SALE PRICE: | $\$ 750,000$ |
| SALE DATE: | $6 / 25 / 2021$ |
| SITE | 21.637 |
|  | Rural |
|  |  |
| DEED REFERENCE: | 202106250111887 |
| FINANCING: | Union Savings |
| COMMENTS: | $\$ 562,500$ |
|  |  |
| PRICE/SF | $\$ 0.80$ |
| PRICE/ACRE | $\$ 34,663$ |



| QUAD: | 2 |
| :---: | :---: |
| TAXING DISTRICT: | 110 |
| PARCEL NUMBER: | 003035 |
| LOCATION: | Ulry Rd (rear), N of Warner |
|  | Blendon Tshp OH 43081 |
| GRANTOR: | Daniel \& Amy Moore |
| GRANTEE: | Board of Park Comm/Franklin |
|  | 1069 W Main St, Westerville, OH |
|  | 614-891-0700 |
| SALE PRICE: | \$168,000 |
| SALE DATE; | 2/25/2021 |
| SITE | 4 |
|  | R1 |
| DEED REFERENCE: | 202102250035312 |
| FINANCING: | Cash to seller |
|  | \$0 |
| COMMENTS: | Split 4.0 acres from 110-000229 and combined to 110-003035 (existing park land). |
| PRICE/SF | \$0.96 |
| PRICE/ACRE | \$42,000 |

RESOLUTION NO, 5876

## AUTHORIZING THE PURCHASE OF REAL ESTATE LOCATED IN BLENDON TOWNSHIP, FRANKLIN COUNTY

WHEREAS, property owned by Daniel and Amy Moore ("Moore's"), consisting of approximately 4 acres, more or less, located in Blendon Township, Franklin County, Ohio is necessary for the preservation of park land; and

WHEREAS, the Park Board deems the purchase of these lands to be in the public interest; and

WHEREAS, the Moore's are a willing seller at a negotiated price of $\$ 168,000$; and
WHEREAS, the costs of a property survey, lot split approval, environmental assessment, title work and other miscellaneous expenses are estimated to be approximately $\$ 15,000$; and

WHEREAS, monies for a total estimated price of $\$ 183,000$ including the above estimated expenses, are available in the 2020 Land Acquisition budget; Now, Therefore,

BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board of Park Commissioners of the Columbus and Franklin County Metropolitan Park District hereby exercises its right to purchase said property and herewith directs and authorizes its Executive Director, as agent for this Board, to contract for the purchase of said property, to prepare the necessary deeds and agreements, and to obtain the execution thereof.

Adopted this $15^{\text {th }}$ day of December, 2020. BOARD OF PARK COMMISSIONERS Columbus and Franklin County

Attest:


$$
\text { Ircenita } 20 \text { Ruclation }
$$



| QUAD: | 3 |
| :---: | :---: |
| TAXING DISTRICT: | 010 |
| PARCEL NUMBER: | 299605-7, 109405 |
| LOCATION: | Noe Bixby Rd, S of Broad St |
|  | Columbus OH 43213 |
| GRANTOR: | Columbus Torah Academy |
|  | David Bernzweig |
| GRANTEE: | City of Columbus |
|  | 90 W Broad St, Columbus, OH |
|  | 614-645-5182 |
| SALE PRICE: | \$800,000 |
| SALE DATE: | 5/8/2019 |
| SITE | 21.962 |
|  | R1 |
| DEED REFERENCE: | 201905080053723/4 |
| FINANCING: | Cash to seller |
|  | \$0 |
| COMMENTS: | Split 4.638 acres from 010-014163 to 299605; 5.922 acres from 010015518 to 299606; 4.461 acres from 010-109405 to 299607. |
| PRICE/SF | \$0.84 |
|  | \$36,427 |

## Kim Wentzel

| From: | Kelly, Ann E [AEKelly@Columbus.gov](mailto:AEKelly@Columbus.gov) |
| :--- | :--- |
| Sent: | Wednesday, June 26, 2019 3:41 PM |
| To: | Kim Wentzel |
| Subject: | RE: Noe Bixby |

Hi Kim,
Sorry, the City Attorney that was involved is on vacation so the person I checked with drew a "blank". It was an acquisition using 2018 Clean Ohio Conservation Fund Round 12 funding project to create the Noe Bixby Parkland and Preserve Clean Water along Big Walnut Creek. Approximately 4+ acres of the property will become a future developed park space and the remaining $17+$ acres will remain as a natural area with plans for future nature trails. The total acreage was 21.962 with a total purchase price was $\$ 800,000$ or $\$ 36,426.55$ per acre.

With best regards,
Ann

From: Kim Wentzel [mailto:kwentzel@moreresearch.net]
Sent: Wednesday, June 26, 2019 1:23 PM
To: Kelly, Ann E [AEKelly@Columbus.gov](mailto:AEKelly@Columbus.gov)
Subject: RE: Noe Bixby

There were two conveyance. Parcels included 010-014163, split 4.638 acres to 010-299605; 010-015518, split 5.922 acres to 010-299606; 010-109405 4.461 and 6.941. (The conveyance for this last parcel was not in the scans to I don't know how the splits went, but it's two sections now.)

Thanks!

Kim Wentzel
Mid Ohio Real Estate Research. Ine.
11138 York Rd, Etna, OH 43105
614-203-9554 (cell)
740-927-4402 (office)

From: Kelly, Ann E [mailto:AEKelly@Columbus.gov]
Sent: Tuesday, June 25, 2019 5:48 PM
To: Kim Wentzel [kwentzel@moreresearch.net](mailto:kwentzel@moreresearch.net)
Subject: RE: Noe Bixby

Hi Kim,
Do you have a parcel number and/or a date of transfer? To the best of my and City Attorney's knowledge the City has not purchased this property. Let me know if you have any additional information \& I will research further.

Thanks,
Ann
Ann E. Kelly, Administrator
Real Estate Management Office

Department of Finance \& Management
90 W Broad Street, Room 425
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Off: (614) 645-5182

From: Kim Wentzel [mailto:kwentzel@moreresearch.net]
Sent: Tuesday, June 25, 2019 3:08 PM
To: Kelly, Ann E[AEKelly@Columbus.gov](mailto:AEKelly@Columbus.gov)
Subject:

Hi Ann!
Hope all's well.

Looking for info on city's acquisition of approximately 22 acres on Noe-Bixby from Torah Academy. Do you know anything about this, or who I would ask. I can't find anything in council minutes - which might mean they didn't buy it, not sure.

Thanks!

Kim

Kim Wentzel
Whid Ohio Real Estate Research. Inc.
11138 York Rd, Etna, OH 43105
614-203-9554 (cell)
740-927-4402 (office)

FRANKLIN COUNTY, OH $\qquad$ Recorded: 05/08/2019 04:34:49 PM $\qquad$ Instrument \#: 201905080053723 $\qquad$ Page: 7 of 14 $\qquad$



FOR 4.461 ACRE LOT SPLIT PARCEL
כ BEING IN HALF SECTION 3, TOWNSHIP 12 NORTH, RANGE 21 WEST, REFUGEE LANDS, AND BEING A 4.461 ACRE PARCEL. IN OFFICIAL RECORD VOLUME 34326 , PAGE J11, WTTH ALL RECORD REFERENCES CITED HEREIN BEING OF THE FRANKLIN



I certify that, to the best of my knowledge and belief,

1. The statements of fact contained in this Report are true and correct.
2. The reported analyses, opinions and conclusions are limited only by the reported assumptions and limiting conditions and is my personal unbiased professional analyses, opinions, and conclusions.
3. I have no present or prospective interest in the property that is the Subject of this Report and I have no personal interest or bias with respect to the parties involved.
4. I have no bias with respect to the property that is the Subject of this Report or to the parties involved with this assignment.
5. My engagement in this assignment was not contingent upon developing or reporting predetermined results.
6. My compensation for completing this assignment is not contingent upon the development or reporting of a predetermined value or direction in value that favors the cause of the Client, the amount of the value opinion, the attainment of a stipulated result, or the occurrence of a subsequent event directly related to the Intended Use of this appraisal.
7. The reported analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this Report has been prepared, in conformity with the requirements of the Code of Professional Ethics \& Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute, which include The Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice.
8. The use of this Report is subject to the requirements of the Appraisal Institute relating to review by its duly authorized representatives.
9. I have made a personal visitation of the property that is the Subject of this Report.
10. No one provided significant real property appraisal assistance to the persons signing this certification.
11. As of the date of this Report, I, James R. Horner, MAI, have completed the continuing education program of the Appraisal Institute.
12. I have performed no services, as an Appraiser or in any other capacity, regarding the property that is the subject of this Report within the three-year period immediately preceding acceptance of this assignment.
13. The real estate which is the Subject of this Appraisal Report was valued as of: October 20, 2023 (Visitation Date and Effective Date).

HORNER APPRAISAL GROUP, INC

James R. Horner, MAI
October 24, 2023
Date

I certify that, to the best of my knowledge and belief,

1. The statements of fact contained in this Report are true and correct.
2. The reported analyses, opinions and conclusions are limited only by the reported assumptions and limiting conditions and is my personal unbiased professional analyses, opinions, and conclusions.
3. I have no present or prospective interest in the property that is the Subject of this Report and I have no personal interest or bias with respect to the parties involved.
4. I have no bias with respect to the property that is the Subject of this Report or to the parties involved with this assignment.
5. My engagement in this assignment was not contingent upon developing or reporting predetermined results.
6. My compensation for completing this assignment is not contingent upon the development or reporting of a predetermined value or direction in value that favors the cause of the Client, the amount of the value opinion, the attainment of a stipulated result, or the occurrence of a subsequent event directly related to the Intended Use of this appraisal.
7. The reported analyses, opinions and conclusions were developed, and this Report has been prepared, in conformity with the requirements of the Code of Professional Ethics \& Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice of the Appraisal Institute, which include The Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice.
8. The use of this Report is subject to the requirements of the Appraisal Institute relating to review by its duly authorized representatives.
9. I have made a personal visitation of the property that is the Subject of this Report.
10. No one provided significant real property appraisal assistance to the persons signing this certification.
11. As of the date of this Report, I, Samuel R. Horner, MAI, have completed the continuing education program of the Appraisal Institute.
12. I have performed no services, as an Appraiser or in any other capacity, regarding the property that is the subject of this Report within the three-year period immediately preceding acceptance of this assignment.
13. The real estate which is the Subject of this appraisal Report was valued as of: October 20, 2023 (Visitation Date and Effective Date).

HORNER APPRAISAL GROUP, INC.


October 24, 2023
Samuel R. Horner, MAI, AI-GRS
Date
GA Certification \#430914

ADDENDUM
PREPARED FOR:
EPCON COMMUNITIES
500 STONEHENGE PARKWAY
DUBLIN, OHIO 43017
P: (614) 761-1010
SUBMITAL:
SEPTEMBER 15, 2023
RE-SUBMITTAL:
OCTOBER 2, 2023
CIVIL ENGINEER, LAND PLANNER
\& LANDSCAPE ARCHITECT
EMHT M




## CITY OF COLUMBUS - LOCATION MAP



HORNER APPRAISAL GROUP INC

## DEFINITION OF MARKET VALUE

Market Value is defined as follows:
"The most probable price which a property should bring in a competitive and open market under all conditions requisite to a fair sale, the buyer and seller each acting prudently and knowledgeably and assuming the price is not affected by undue stimulus."

Implicit in this definition are the consummation of a sale as of a specified date and the passing of title from seller to buyer under conditions whereby:

1. Buyer and seller are typically motivated;
2. Both parties are well informed or well advised, and acting in what they consider their own best interests;
3. A reasonable time is allowed for exposure in the open market;
4. Payment is made in terms of cash in U.S. dollars or in terms of financial arrangements comparable thereto; and
5. The price represents the normal consideration for the property sold unaffected by special or creative financing or sales concessions granted by anyone associated with the sale. ${ }^{1}$

## DEFINITION OF MARKET VALUE AS DEFINED IN MOST RECENT EDITION OF USPAP

Market Value: a type of value, stated as an opinion, that presumes the transfer of a property (i.e., a right of ownership or a bundle of such rights), as of a certain date, under specific conditions set forth in the definition of the term identified by the appraiser as applicable in an appraisal.

Comment: Forming an opinion of market value is the purpose of many real property appraisal assignments, particularly when the client's intended use includes more than one intended user. The conditions included in the market value definitions establish market perspectives for development of the opinion. These conditions may vary from definition to definition but generally fall into three categories:

1. The relationship, knowledge, and motivation of the parties (i.e., seller and buyer):
2. The terms of sale (e.g., cash, cash equivalent, or other terms); and
3. The conditions of sale (e.g., exposure in a competitive market for a reasonable time prior to sale). ${ }^{2}$

[^0]${ }^{2}$ USPAP, 2014-2015 Edition, The Appraisal Standards Board, Page U-3.

## LIMITING CONDITIONS - PART I

The Certificate of Appraisal and report hereto attached are made expressly subject to the conditions and stipulations following:

No responsibility is assumed by the appraiser for matters which are legal in nature, nor is any opinion on the title rendered herewith. This appraisal assumed good title. Any liens or encumbrances which may now exist have been disregarded and the property has been appraised as though no delinquencies in the payment of general taxes or special assessments exist, and as though free of indebtedness.

Possession of this report, or any copy thereof, does not carry with it the right of publication, nor may the same be used for any purpose by any but the applicant without the previous written consent of the appraiser or the applicant, and, in any event, only in its entirety.

The appraiser herein, by reason of employment to make this appraisal, agrees to give testimony and/or attend in court or any other governmental hearing with reference to the property in question, provided sufficient notice shall be given to him. The client's attorney shall have the right to determine what is considered sufficient notice, subject to approval by the appraiser.

The appraiser herein has no present or future contemplated interest in the property appraised.

Employment of James R. Horner and/or Samuel R. Horner to make the appraisal hereto attached is in no manner contingent upon the value reported.

The values for land and improvements as contained in the written report are constituent parts of the total value reported, and neither is to be used in making a summation appraisal by combination with values created by another appraiser. Either is invalidated if so used. The current purchasing power of the dollar is the basis for the value reported.

Neither all nor any part of the contents of this report, or copy thereof, shall be used for any purpose by anyone but the client or its assigns without previous written consent of the appraiser and/or of the client or its assigns; nor shall it be conveyed by any including the client to the public through advertising, public relations, news, sales or other media, without the written consent and approval of the author, particularly as to the valuation conclusions, the identity of the appraiser, or a firm with which he is connected, or any reference to any professional society or institute of any initialed designations conferred upon the appraiser.

## LIMITING CONDITIONS - PART II

The opinion of value contained in this appraisal report is based upon the following Assumptions and Limiting Conditions:

- The information furnished by others is believed to be reliable. No warranty is given for its accuracy, though.
- No responsibility is assumed for the legal description or for matters including legal or title considerations. Title to the property is assumed to be good and marketable unless otherwise stated.
- The property is appraised free and clear of any or all liens or encumbrances unless otherwise stated in the report.
- It is assumed that there is full compliance with all applicable federal, state and local environmental regulations, laws and license requirements unless otherwise stated in the report.
- The distribution, if any, of that total valuation in this report between land and improvements applies only under the stated program of utilization. The separate valuations for land and improvements must not be used in conjunction with any other appraisal and are invalid if so used.
- The value opinions, and the costs used, are as of the date of the value opinion.
- All engineering is assumed to be correct. The plot plans and other illustrative material in this report are included only to assist the reader in visualizing the property.
- The proposed improvements, if any, on or off-site, as well as any repairs required, are considered, for purposes of the appraisal, to be completed in a good and workmanlike manner according to information submitted and/or considered by the appraiser.
- Responsible ownership and competent property management are assumed.
- It is assumed that the utilization of the land and improvements is within the boundaries or property lines of the property described and that there is no encroachment or trespass unless noted in the report.
- The appraisers are not required to give further consultation, testimony, or be in attendance in court with reference to the property in question unless arrangements have been previously made.
- It is assumed that there are no hidden or unapparent conditions of the property, subsoil or structures that make it more or less valuable. No responsibility is assumed for such conditions or for arranging for engineering or environmental studies that may be required to discover them.
- Unless otherwise stated in this report, the existence of hazardous materials, which may or may not be present on or in the property, were not observed by the appraisers. The appraisers have no knowledge of the existence of such materials on or in the property. The appraisers, however, are not qualified to detect such substances. The presence of such substances may affect the value of the property.


## LIMITING CONDITIONS - PART II - (CONTINUED)

- The value opinion is predicated on the assumption that there is no such material on or in the property that would cause a loss in value. No responsibility is assumed for any such conditions, or for any expertise or engineering knowledge required to discover them. The client is urged to retain an expert in the field, if desired.
- All mechanical components are assumed to be in good, operable condition unless otherwise noted.
- Our opinion of value does not consider the effect (if any) of possible noncompliance with the requirements of the ADA .
- Horner Appraisal Group, Inc. and its employees accept no responsibility for changes in market conditions or the inability of the client, intended user, or any other party to achieve desired outcomes.
- Projections or estimates of desired outcomes by the client, intended user, or any other party may be affected by future events. The client, intended user or any other party using this report acknowledges and accepts that Horner Appraisal Group, Inc. and its employees have no liability arising from these events.
- Unless specifically set forth, nothing contained herein shall be construed to represent any direct or indirect recommendations of Horner Appraisal Group, Inc., its officers or employees to provide financing (mortgage, equity or other) for the property at the value(s) stated.
- The client, or its representative(s), agrees to indemnify and hold Horner Appraisal Group, Inc., its officers and employees, harmless from and against any loss, damages, claims, and expenses (including costs and reasonable attorney fees) sustained as a result of negligence or intentional acts or omissions by the client, or its representative(s) arising from or in any way connected with the use of or purported reliance upon, the appraisal report or any part of the appraisal report.
- The contents of the appraisal report, and all attachments and information that will be contained within the report, is proprietary and confidential. The client, or its representative(s) will not release or provide the report, in any form, in whole or in part, to any third party, including any borrower, potential borrower, buyer or potential buyer, without the signing appraiser's express written authorization.


# OUALIFICATIONS OF THE APPRAISER <br> JAMES R. HORNER, MAI 

## PRESENT STATUS

President of Horner Appraisal Group, Inc., an independent real estate appraising and consulting firm, specializing in investment properties.

## BUSINESS ADDRESS

22 East Gay Street
Suite 300
Columbus, Ohio 43215

## PHONE NUMBERS

Office
(614) 246-8383

Fax
Cell
E-Mail
(614) 246-8384
(614) 284-8888
james@hornerappraisal.com

## DEGREES

Bachelor of Arts, The Ohio State University, 1969

## PROFESSIONAL MEMBERSHIPS

Appraisal Institute: MAI \#5762

## FORMAL REAL ESTATE EDUCATION

Appraisal Institute

1. Attendance at numerous seminars and lectures dealing with new techniques in real estate, real estate appraisal, finance, etc.
2. Formerly on the faculty of Otterbein College.
3. Currently certified under the Continuing Education Program of the Appraisal Institute.
4. The appraiser is certified as a General Appraiser (GA) within the State of Ohio (See copy of certificate following qualifications).

## REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL EXPERIENCE

Mr. Horner is engaged full-time in the real estate appraisal profession. From 1968 to January of 1971, he was under the training and supervision of Anthony F. Mollica, MAI. From 1971 to October of 1977, Mr. Horner was employed and was Vice President of Associated Consultants and Appraisers, Inc., Columbus, Ohio. In October of 1977, Mr. Horner formed his own firm. Since 1971, the appraiser has made numerous appraisal reports, including feasibility studies for apartment and condominium projects, office buildings, single-family residences and commercial properties. The purpose of the appraisal reports has been for condemnation, mortgage and for individual buying and selling. The Horner Appraisal Group has had the opportunity of appraising for many Federal, State, and Local Agencies, including, but not limited to, The Federal Aviation Administration, US Department of the Interior and Agriculture, The Ohio Department of Transportation, The Ohio Department of Natural Resources, COTA, and many City Agencies throughout the State of Ohio.

## APPRAISER DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

In compliance with Ohio Revised Code Section 4763.12 (C)

1. Name of Appraiser: $\qquad$ James R. Horner. MAI
2. Class of Certification/Licensure:


Certified
Certified Residential Licensed Residential Temporary $\qquad$ General $\qquad$ Licensed

Certification/Licensure Number: $\qquad$ GA. Certification \#380744
3. Scope: This report $\qquad$ X. is within the scope of my Certification/License.
$\qquad$ is not within the scope of my Certification/License.
4. Service Provided By: $\qquad$ disinterested \& unbiased third party Interested \& biased third party
$\qquad$ Interested third party on contingent fee basis
5. Signature of person preparing and reporting the appraisal:


THIS FORM MUST BE INCLUDED IN CONJUNCTION WITH ALL APPRAISAL ASSIGNMENTS OR SPECIALIZED SERVICES PERFORMED BY A STATE-CERTIFIED OR STATE-LICENSED REAL ESTATE APPRAISER.
$\qquad$
State of Ohio
Department of Commerce
Division of Real Estate
Appraiser Section
Cleveland, Ohio
(216) 787-3100

THIS IS TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT
HAS QUALIFIED UNDER THE LAWS AND REVISED CODE OF THE STATE OF OHIO AND THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE
REAL ESTATE APPRAISER BOARD AND IS A DULY CERTIFIED AND QUALIFIED PERSON TO ENGAGE IN THE PRACTICE
OF GENERAL REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL.
Witness the seal of the Ohio Department of Commerce, Division of Real Estate and the signatures of this board this 16 th day of
June 1993 .
HORNER, JAMES R.

June 1993.
装
右
8

# QUALIFICATIONS OF THE APPRAISER <br> SAMUEL R. HORNER 

## PRESENT STATUS

Vice President of Horner Appraisal Group, Inc., an independent real estate appraising and consulting firm, specializing in investment properties.

## BUSINESS ADDRESS

22 East Gay Street
Suite 300
Columbus, Ohio 43215

PHONE NUMBERS
Office (614) 246-8383
Fax (614) 246-8384
Cell (614) 284-8000
E-Mail sam@hornerappraisal.com

## DEGREES

B.S., Business Administration, Colorado State University, 1993

Emphasis: Real Estate/Finance

## PROFESSIONAL MEMBERSHIP

Appraisal Institute: MAI, AI-GRS

## FORMAL REAL ESTATE EDUCATION

Real Estate Principals
Real Estate Finance
Real Estate Law
Real Estate Appraisal

## REAL ESTATE LICENSES

Ohio Certified General Appraiser, \#430914
Ohio Sales Associate License, issued 6-17-97

## REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL EXPERIENCE

For approximately two years, Mr. Horner was employed with D.F. Davis Real Estate, Inc., located in San Diego, California. During this period, Mr. Horner worked on a myriad of investment properties. In 1996, Mr. Horner became Vice President of the Horner Appraisal Group, Inc.

## APPRAISER DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

In compliance with Ohio Revised Code Section 4763.12 (C)

1. Name of Appraiser: $\qquad$ Samuel R. Homer. MAI
2. Class of Certification/Licensure:


Certification/Licensure Number: GA Certification \#430914
3. Scope: This report _X_ is within the scope of my Certification/License.
_ is not within the scope of my Certification/License.
4. Service Provided By:_X_disinterested \& unbiased third party
$\qquad$
$\qquad$ Interested third party on contingent fee basis
5. Signature of person preparing and reporting the appraisal:


THIS FORM MUST BE INCLUDED IN CONJUNCTION WITH ALL APPRAISAL ASSIGNIMENTS OR SPECIALIZED SERVICES PERFORMED BY A STATE-CERTIFIED OR STATE-LICENSED REAL ESTATE APPRAISER.
State of Ohio
Department of Commerce
Division of Real Estate
Appraiser Section
Cleveland, Ohio
(216) 787-3100



## AN APPRAISER LICENSE/CERTIFICATE

 has been issued under ORC Chapter 4763 to:
## "me <br> James R Horner

 hCICERT NUMBER:000380744
uc level:
Certified General Real Estate Appraiser current issue date:
Ohio
Department
of Commerce 06/25/2023 expration date: 07/01/2024 USPAP DUE DATE:
Division of Real Estate \& Professional Licensing

## AN APPRAISER LICENSEICERTIFICATE

## has been issued under ORC Chapter 4763 to:

# NA ME: <br> Samuel Robert Horner <br> UCICERT NUMBER: <br> 000430914 <br> uc level: 

Certified General Real Estate Appraiser curresit esue date:
08/22/2023
Ohio
Department ouprnow ante
of Commerce 10/17/2024
Division of Real Estate USPAP DUE DATE:
a protessonal Leomang 10/17/2024


Engineers, Surveyors, Planners, Scientists

February 7, 2024

Ms. Chelsea Nichols
City of New Albany
99 W. Main Street
New Albany, OH 43054

Subject: Courtyards at Haines Creek
Review Response Letter \#2

Ms. Nichols:
Thank you for the review of our FDP and FPL applications for the Courtyards at Haines Creek. Below are the revisions the City has requested. Our responses are provided in red as to how we addressed these in the resubmittal materials. Note that per our correspondence, the FPL applications are being withdrawn and instead we are submitting a Preliminary Plat for Phase 1, therefore, FPL responses are omitted from this response letter and those comments will be addressed in the future.

## Application: FDP 87-2023

Items from Planning Commission Staff Report - October 16, 2023:
Page 1
The Parks and Trails Advisory Board (PTAB) Conditions of Approval:

1. That the open space amenities shall be installed and included as part of the overall subdivision infrastructure improvements (e.g. streets, utilities, etc.).

Response: The applicant agrees to this condition.
2. That the final alignment of the leisure path shall be subject to staff approval.

Response: The applicant agrees to this condition.
3. Increase the open space with consideration of the wetland on the adjacent property to the north.

Response: The applicant has increased overall open space to 20.02 acres by preparing more detailed stormwater design and overall site grading analysis. The open space deficit has been reduced from 3.36 acres to 1.00 acres. This is detailed throughout the updated FDP plans and can be seen on the Open Space and Pedestrian Connectivity Sheet
4. Review the 42k fee in-lieu payment or purchase land within close proximity to the development.

Response: The applicant has completed an appraisal and will submit to the City as required in Chapter 1165.10 (d).
5. In addition, at the Parks and Trails Advisory Board meeting, the applicant verbally committed to sliding lots 152-155 west to allow pedestrian access at the northeast corner.

Response: The applicant has adjusted lots 152-155 more to the west and incorporated two pedestrian access areas with seating in the northeast and northwest areas of the site adjacent to these lots.
Pages 12 and 13
Based upon the current submittal, staff recommends the following conditions for the future hearing or that they are addressed prior to the next hearing date:

1. That lots on the plats match the lots on the final development plan.

Response: The lots on the plat will be updated to match the lots on the FDP. Final Plat submittal has been withdrawn at this time.
2. Revise location and position of entry sign at Central College Road. Signs to match preexisting residential examples, see image in memo.

Response: The positioning of the entry signs along Central College have been located to match the preexisting condition of the signs for the Courtyards at New Albany.
3. Signage is to be installed at the end of the 10 -foot stubs which indicates that these streets may be extended in the future as a through street. The signage is to be shown on the plans at the time of permitting, subject to staff approval.

Response: The signage has been shown on the FDP and will be shown on the engineering plans at time of permitting.
4. The installation of the leisure path along Central College Road be subject to staff approval.

Response: Per a meeting with Ryan Ohly on 10/23, the path along Central College Road/Jug Street is no longer required due to the proposed waterline/existing culvert constraints. The path internal to the subdivision along the south side of the basin is an acceptable alternative. A path along Central College Road/Jug Street from the western property line to the proposed entrance is shown, but the remaining portion of the path along the roadway has been removed on the FDP.
5. The architectural plans be updated at the time of permitting to meet the city architect's recommendation of the following items:
a. Eliminate the horizontally proportioned grids; and
b. Revise the dormers to reflect suggestions in the sketch provide.

Response: The applicant agrees to this condition and has noted these items on the appropriate architectural sheets in the FDP.
6. The plans be revised at the time of permitting as needed to meet the garage door color requirements, subject to staff approval.

Response: The applicant agrees to this condition.
7. The final shutter hardware design be subject to staff approval.

Response: The applicant agrees to this condition
8. The city floodplain regulations (C.O. Section 1154.02 and 1154.04 ) do not allow for any modifications to this area. The basin and grading plans shall be revised to meet code requirements or a variance can be requested.

Response: The basin design and grading has been modified to meet this condition.
9. The city landscape architect/design consultant comments outlined in the memo dated October 6, 2023 are addressed, subject to staff approval:
i. Review entire development grading plan, focusing on the improvement of the following items.

Response: In an effort to eliminate the need for a wall along the western property line, the applicant has regraded the entire site, redesigned the stormwater basins, and increased the depths of lots 102-108 and 113-124 by shifting Wooster Drive and Haines Creek Drive 8' to the east. This has allowed a majority of the site to be lowered, most notably along the western property line and a 4:1 slope has been incorporated in lieu of a wall.
i. Storm Water Basins - revise basins to increase undulation in grade and create a more naturalized form. Basins should not exceed 6:1 slopes.

Response: The basin design and grading has been modified to meet this condition.
ii. Proposed Wall (west edge of site) - If deemed necessary after thorough review of grading plan, provide a minimum of three to five site condition sections for review. Include plan and details for proposed site condition at break in wall along 'Reserve J'. See diagram.

Response: Revised site grading and layout shift explained in response above has eliminated the need for a wall along the west property line with details provided in the FDP. Grading refinements have been provided in Reserve J, per meeting with City Staff and the City Landscape Architect on 10/18.
ii. If proposed wall is deemed necessary, the use of natural stone is recommended. Developer to provide samples for review by Landscape Architect.

Response: The wall has been removed.
iii. Center the four relocated parcels within Haines Creek and Lourdes Drive, providing access to a leisure path on either side for increased public green space. See diagram.

Response: The applicant has centered lots 152-155 along Lourdes Drive and incorporated two pedestrian access points with seating in the northeast and northwest areas of the site adjacent to these lots.
iv. Provide a site plan that shows how the reserve green space will be used as an amenity for the community (i.e. seating, paths, etc.). See diagram.

Response: This comment is in reference to Reserve J and a seating area with additional landscaping was discussed with the City Landscape Architect and provided in this area.
v. Revise entry sign at Central College Road to match precedents in the neighborhood, see images for reference.

Response: The design of the entry signs along Central College will match the previously approved signs at the Courtyards at New Albany as provided in the FDP.
vi. Review and submit proposed removal of existing tree stands to landscape architect. Provide clear plan boundary for tree removal limits. Preserve the maximum number of established groupings of trees present on the site. Submit tree protection plan. Utilize fencing around tree drip lines for proper protection.

Response: In the meeting with the City Staff and City Landscape Architect, it was agreed that this condition would be provided with final engineering/final landscape plans.
vii. Increase planting adjacent storm water basins. Trees should be planted in randomized spacing and species in groups of 3 to 9 trees. See diagram.

Response: Increased tree plantings have been provided along the stormwater basins.
viii. If proposed wall is deemed necessary, update planting plan to include a seed mix of native grasses for disturbed areas.

Response: The wall has been removed.
ix. Densely plant trees along swale. Trees should be planted in randomized spacing and species in groups of 3 to 9 trees. See diagram.

Response: The swale has been densely planted with additional, random tree massings.
10. The final lighting details are subject to staff approval.

Response: The applicant agrees to this condition.
Page 11
ENGINEER'S COMMENTS
The City Engineer has reviewed the referenced plan in accordance with the engineering related requirements of Code Section $1159.07(b)(3)$ and provided the following comments. Staff recommends a condition of approval that these comments be addressed, subject to staff approval.

1. All of the city engineer comments be addressed, subject to staff approval.

Response: See below.
2. Refer to Exhibit A. Please modify the Cover Sheet to show all signature blocks and notes shown on this Exhibit.

Response: The cover has been modified.
3. Refer to Exhibit B. Add a sheet to the Index of Drawings entitled Turn Lane Improvements. Verify that the turn lane is in fact to be built "By Others".

Response: This sheet has been added to the FDP. The turn lane sheet has been added to the Cover Sheet Index of Drawings. Turn lane construction timing coordination is ongoing with City Staff.
4. Sheet 2 of 16 . Notes indicate that the City of New Albany shall have some maintenance responsibility relative to the Reserves. This is consistent with the plat. The HOA maintains all reserves and only owns the reserve with the private club house.

Response: No further action.
5. Sheet 3 of 16. Delineate all Reserves that will be utilized for stormwater management as lying within Drainage Easements. Clearly show this on all sheets.

Response: This has been updated on the appropriate plan sheets.
6. Sheet 3 of 16 . Label the width of the Tree Preservation Zone at the north parcel boundary.

Response: This has been labeled on the appropriate FDP sheets.
7. Sheet 5 of 16 . Show the northern swale as lying within a Drainage Easement.

Response: This is indicated on the Site Pan - Sheet 5.
8. Sheet 7 of 16. Add site distance triangles at the curb cuts off of Central College Road and Jug Street. Remove landscaping and fencing that may impede motorist view.

Response: Sheet 23 has been included and shows site distance triangles at each entrance.
9. Provide Fire Truck turning radius analysis.

Response: AutoTurn exhibit has been included as a separate exhibit for reference. See Section I of Submittal Materials per table of contents.
10. "No Parking Signs" be added along curved sections of streets.

Response: Signs have been shown on sheet 4 along Cedarville Drive and Defiance Drive curves.
11. In accordance with code sections 1159.07 (b)(3) Z and AA, the applicant provide documentation indicating that all OEPA and ACOE permitting requirements have been obtained.

Response: An updated environmental letter has been included indicating Army Corps of Engineers issuance of AJD letter. Approved permits will be provided at time of final engineering.
12. We will evaluate storm water management, sanitary sewer collection and roadway construction related details once construction plans become available.

Response: Applicant will provide with final engineering documents.

## CITY OF NEW ALBANY EMAIL COMMENTS - 1/25/24

## Revised grading plan review comments:

1. Confirm no additional trees will be removed with this grading plan. It appears as though 3 additional trees may be preserved. Please verify.
i. Previous EMH\&T response: No additional trees are being removed. We are saving 1 additional tree with the revised layout showing the slope in lieu of the wall.
ii. ii. Status: complete.
2. Please provide sections that were previously requested.
i. Previous EMH\&T response: We will provide this with the FDP submission.
ii. Status: Complete. EMH\&T submitted one section. They appear acceptable but the city recommends that the $4: 1$ slope be planted with meadow grass. The city also recommends undulating the mounds where possible and around large tree bases to provide a more natural aesthetic. This can be included in the updated FDP submittal.

Current EMH\&T Response: Section has been updated with meadow grass extending up the slope. Buffer plan has been updated with undulating mounds where possible.
3. The city staff suggests that you enhance and soften the remaining slope along the west side with landscaping.
i. Previous EMH\&T response: We will review and take it under consideration
ii. Status: See comment above. This can be included in the updated FDP submittal.

## Current EMH\&T Response: Additional landscaping shown along slope.

4. Please be prepared to explain how stormwater is being controlled with the outlets. Also be prepared to discuss environmental impacts and flood protection code.
i. Previous EMH\&T response: Understood
ii. Status: The city staff recommends the applicant's engineer attend the planning commission meeting to discuss these items.

Current EMH\&T Response: Engineer will be in attendance and stormwater management, environmental impacts, and flood protection code can be discussed as needed.
5. Your last submittal showed gravel as opposed to grass in the rear of the homes. Staff had asked for this to be revised. The resubmittal should show this - perhaps on the sections mentioned above.
i. Previous EMH\&T response: We will provide updated sections with the FDP submission. Gravel is not necessary as the wall has been removed.
ii. Status: Complete. EMH\&T submitted one section. They appear acceptable but the city recommends that the $4: 1$ slope be planted with meadow grass. This can be included in the updated FDP submittal.

Current EMH\&T Response: Section has been updated with meadow grass extending up the slope.

## Floodplain study review comments:

6. Make sure the exhibits in the study match the titles shown in the table of contents.
i. Status: The floodplain study review comments have been addressed and are complete.
7. Verify which areas are draining into the Epcon site, in relation to the Dragon Fly Study. Update Haines Creek study to clearly show these areas.
i. Status: The floodplain study review comments have been addressed and are complete

## Additional comments, submittals and action items:

8. Withdraw final plat applications. These may be replaced by preliminary plat applications.
i. Status: Not completed yet. This can be done with the resubmittal of the FDP application.

Current EMH\&T Response: Final plat applications are being withdrawn and replaced with a phase 1 preliminary plat application.
9. Provide a letter detailing the impacts, permits required, authorities having jurisdiction, public involvement, and so on. The city will suggest that the nearby residents are kept informed of the public involvement timing as a condition of approval for the FDP.
i. Status: Incomplete. Based on feedback from residents and Planning Commission, we strongly recommend updating this letter with a commitment that Epcon will keep the neighbors informed of these permits with the revised FDP submittal.

Current EMH\&T Response: Epcon will comply with the typical public notice procedure per Ohio EPA process.
10. Provide MOU Infrastructure Improvements/Maintenance - Epcon to draft an MOU outlining the infrastructure improvements and process along with the Haines Creek ditch maintenance and culvert improvement at the northeast corner of the site.
ii. Status: MOU submitted but the City has revisions and comments that need to be updated.

Current EMH\&T Response: Per coordination with the City, the MOU comments may be addressed after the FDP submission, but before the public meeting. Epcon is actively working on addressing the MOU comments.

Please contact me at (614) 775-4409 if you have any questions or require additional information.
Sincerely,
EVANS, MECHWART, HAMBLETON \& TILTON, INC.


Sydney Berry, PE
Project Manager















WEST BUFFER SEATING AREA LANDSCAPE ENLARGEMENT


West of Lot 155


East of Lot 152
$\xrightarrow[\text { NORTH BUFFER SEATING AREA LANDSCAPE ENLARGEMENT }]{\text { (TPCCAL O F FTO LOCATIONS. RERP PLAN }}$

 ERENNALISORN. Grasses

 | Cont. |
| :---: |
| cont. |
| cont. |
| Cont. |$\frac{\text { Notes }}{1 .}$

$$
\frac{\text { Notes: }}{1 .} \text { All }
$$

HAINES CREEK DRIVE LOT LANDSCAPE ENLARGEMENT


$$
\begin{gathered}
\text { Sill dimensions as shown hereon } \\
\text { coll } \\
\text { Lot nimed }
\end{gathered}
$$

2. Confirme with Final Engine eing.

graphic scale
$\underbrace{\text { GRAPHIC SCALE }}_{1 \text { inch }=20 \text { feet }}$






| Legend |  |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | Removals within 30' Tree Preservation Zone |
|  | Removals between 30' Tree Preservation Rone and 50' Rear Setback |
| 1 | City of New Albany Forester eviluoted the tree ond recommens soving the |







# Planning Commission Staff Report <br> March 4, 2024 Meeting 

## COURTYARDS AT HAINES CREEK SUBDIVISION PRELIMINARY PLAT

LOCATION:<br>Generally located at the northwest corner of the intersection at Central College Road and Jug Street Rd NW (PIDs: 222-005156, 222-005157, 222-005158, 222-005159).<br>APPLICANT: EC New Vision Ohio LLC, c/o Aaron L. Underhill, Esq.<br>REQUEST: Preliminary Plat<br>ZONING: Courtyards at Haines Creek I-PUD Zoning District<br>STRATEGIC PLAN: Residential District<br>APPLICATION: PPL-09-2024

Review based on: Application materials received February 7, 2024 and February 20, 2024.
Staff report completed by Chelsea Nichols, Planner.

## I. REQUEST AND BACKGROUND

This preliminary plat application is for the Courtyards at Haines Creek subdivision. This subdivision includes 151 residential lots, 12 reserves (A, B, C1, C2, D, E, F1, F2, G, I, J, K), and ten new public streets on $63.5+/$ - acres.

The Planning Commission reviewed the zoning change and preliminary development plan for the property on June 20, 2023 (ZC-07-2023) and the zoning change was adopted by city council on July 18, 2023 (O-84-2023).

There is a related final development plan application on the March $4^{\text {th }}$ Planning Commission agenda. This application is reviewed under a separate staff report (FDP-87-2023).

## II. SITE DESCRIPTION \& USE

The $63.5+/$ - acre subdivision is located in Franklin County. The site is generally located at the northwest corner of the intersection at Central College Road and Jug Street Rd NW. The site is located immediately west of the Licking County line and immediately, north of Agricultural zoned and residentially used properties, and there are unincorporated residentially zoned and used properties to the west and north of the site.

## III. PLAN REVIEW

The Planning Commission's review authority of the plat is found under C.O. Section 1187. The staff's review is based on New Albany plans and studies, zoning text, and zoning regulations.

## Residential Lots

1. The preliminary plat is consistent with the proposed Courtyards at Haines Creek final development plan. The plat shows 151 residential lots. The proposed lot layout and dimensions match what is shown on the final development plan and meet the requirements of the zoning text.
o The plat appropriately shows the lot widths to be at least 52 feet, as required by zoning text section VI(D).
o The plat appropriately shows the lot depths to be at least 115 feet, as required by zoning text section $\mathrm{VI}(\mathrm{E})$.
o The plat appropriately shows the following front yard setbacks, as required by the zoning text section $\operatorname{VI}(\mathrm{F})(2)$ :

- A 15 -foot setback for Lane Homes (lots 100 and 101).
- A 20-foot setback for all other lots on the preliminary plat.
o Zoning text section $\mathrm{VI}(\mathrm{F})(1)$ states that there shall be a minimum building and pavement setback of 100 feet from the Central College Road and Jug Street right-of-way. However, the text states that homes and other improvements located on lots 71 and 72 may encroach into this setback. This setback is shown on the plat.
0 At the Parks and Trails Advisory Board meeting on Monday, October 2, 2023, the applicant verbally committed to sliding lots 152-155 west to allow access at the northeast corner. The Planning Commission should evaluate the lot location as part of the Final Development Plan application. Staff recommends a condition of approval that the lots on this plat match the lots on the final development plan (condition \#1).


## Streets

1. The plat creates ten (10) new publicly dedicated streets totaling $10.14+/$ - acres. All of the new streets meet the right-of-way requirements in the zoning text:
o Haines Creek Drive provides access to the subdivision from Central College Road, with 60 feet of right-of-way.
o Cedarville Drive, provides access to the subdivision from Jug Street, with 50 feet of right-of-way.
o McClellan Drive East, is stubbed from this development to the west property line to provide for a future connection with the existing portion of McClellan Drive located in the Tidewater subdivision, with 50 feet of right-of-way.
o The city police chief has reviewed the street name and recommends this name be changed to distinguish it from the existing McClellan Drive in the existing Tidewater subdivision located generally to the west of this site. The city staff recommends a condition of approval that the street name be changed to a unique name (condition \#2).
o Wooster Drive, with 50 feet of right-of-way.
o Hiram Lane, a publicly dedicated alley, with 20 feet of right-of-way.
o Findlay Drive, with 50 feet of right-of-way.
o Heidelberg Drive, is stubbed from this development to the west property line to provide for a future connection, with 50 feet of right-of-way.
O Marietta Drive, with 50 feet of right-of-way.
o Lourdes Drive, with 50 feet of right-of-way.
o Defiance Drive, with 50 feet of right-of-way.
2. The utility easements are shown on the plat.
3. Per the city's subdivision regulations, C.O. 1187.04, all new streets shall be named and shall be subject to the approval of the Planning Commission. The applicant proposes to utilize the names of private Ohio colleges as street names within the subdivision. Haines Creek Drive shares the same name as the subdivision.

Parkland, Open Space and Tree Preservation Areas

1. The plat contains twelve (12) reserve areas shown as Reserves "A", "B", "C1", "C2", "D", "E", "F1", "F2", "G", "H", "I", "J", and "K" on the plat with a total acreage of 20.02+/- acres.
o According to the plat notes, all Reserves other than " H " shall be owned by the City of New Albany and maintained by the homeowner's association in perpetuity for open space and/or stormwater retention.
o The plat states that Reserve " $H$ " will be owned and maintained by the homeowner's association for a community amenity area.
o The plat states that Reserve " $I$ " and " $K$ " shall be owned by the City of New Albany and maintained by the homeowner's association until a public road is constructed within the reserves and is dedicated to the city as public right-of-way. Specifically, the city will maintain just the street, which is everything between and including the concrete curbs. Everything else outside of the curbs must be maintained by the HOA in perpetuity.
o The plat states Reserve " J " shall be owned by the City of New Albany and maintained by the homeowner's association in perpetuity for open space and/or stormwater retention.
o The plat states trees as shown on the Final Development Plan within Reserve "J" shall be preserved and subject to staff approval. Within this reserve, only the construction of paths/trails/sidewalks, underground utility lines and underground storm water management infrastructure shall be permitted.
o The plat includes a 14 -foot-wide general utility easement along Wooster Drive. A plat note requires healthy mature trees and understory vegetation to be preserved unless they conflict with the installation of permitted utility or storm water infrastructure. And, when trees are removed from the reserve due to utility installation, reasonable efforts shall be made to plant new trees in areas within the reserve. Trees shall not be required to be planted in easements and/or locations that may harm the health of preserved trees or unreasonably encroach into the rear yards of lots.
o Trees and understory vegetation within the reserve may be trimmed, cut, or removed if they are diseased, dead, or of a noxious species or if they present a threat of danger to persons or property.
o The plat states that within the area consisting of Reserve C1 and C2, the application of fertilizer or other lawn treatment chemicals shall be prohibited. Within this area, prairie grass shall be planted and maintained and the landscape plan shall provide for the planting of additional trees to increase buffering of the site from the properties to the north.
2. Various tree preservation zones are shown on the preliminary plat and comply with the tree preservation zone requirements of zoning text section $\mathrm{VI}(\mathrm{G})$.
3. The plat requires the developer to provide Tree Preservation Zone signs on every other lot line. It states the design shall be subject to staff approval and shall be installed by the developer before infrastructure acceptance by the city.
4. C.O. 1187.04(d)(4) and (5) requires verification that an application, if required, has been submitted to the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency in compliance with Section 401 of the Clean Water Act and to the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers in compliance with Section 404 of the Clean Water Act. The applicant states that a delineation report is currently under review with the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers; however, the permits have not yet been issued. Staff requests evidence of any permits received from the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency as a condition of approval (condition \#3).

## IV. ENGINEER'S COMMENTS

The City Engineer has reviewed the referenced plan in accordance with the engineering related requirements of Code Section 1159.07(b)(3) and provided the following comments. Staff recommends a condition of approval that these comments be addressed by the applicant, subject to staff approval (condition \#4).

1. The project narrative states that proposed stormwater retention will be provided within Reserves A and C. Sheet 3 of the 3 of the plans contain notes however permitting stormwater retention within Reserve J and within the Tree Preservation Zones (TPZ). We recommend that reference to underground retention be removed from the Reserve J and TPZ note blocks.
2. Clearly show each of the three phases on the Vicinity Map shown on sheet 1 of 3 .
3. Clearly delineate the area represented by the 100-year water surface elevation at each basin and show this area as lying within a drainage easement.
4. Note that City Policy is to provide drainage structures at every other parcel line in rear yard areas. This may require that a drainage easement be shown in the rear yard areas of Lots 102-124.
5. Notify staff one week in advance of the beginning of the Ohio EPA public comment period regarding wetland permitting.

## V. ACTION

## Basis for Approval:

The preliminary plat is generally consistent with the final development plan and meets code requirements. Should the Planning Commission approve the application, the following motion would be appropriate:

## Suggested Motion for PPL-09-2024:

Move to approve preliminary plat application PPL-09-2024 with the following conditions:

1. That the lots on this plat match the lots on the final development plan.
2. That the proposed McClellan Drive street name be changed to a unique name to distinguish it from the existing McClellan Drive in the existing Tidewater subdivision located generally to the west of this site.
3. Evidence of any permits received from the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency shall be provided to the city staff.
4. The city engineer comments are addressed, subject to staff approval.
5. Approval of the preliminary plat is contingent upon the approval of the final development plan for this development.

## Approximate Site Location:



Source: ArcGIS
404.616-02

February 19, 2024
To: Chelsea Nichols City Planner

From: Matt Ferris, P.E., P.S.
By: Jay M. Herskowitz, P.E., BCEE

Re: The Courtyards at Haines Creek Preliminary Plat Phase 1, 2 and 3

We reviewed the referenced plat in accordance with Code Section 1187.05. Our review comments are as follows:

1. The project narrative states that proposed stormwater retention will be provided within Reserves $A$ and $C$. Sheet 3 of the 3 of the plans contain notes however permitting stormwater retention within Reserve $J$ and within the Tree Preservation Zones (TPZ). We recommend that reference to underground retention be removed from the Reserve J and TPZ note blocks.
2. Clearly show each of the three phases on the Vicinity Map shown on sheet 1 of 3.
3. Clearly delineate the area represented by the 100 year water surface elevation at each basin and show this area as lying within a drainage easement.
4. Note that City Policy is to provide drainage structures at every other parcel line in rear yard areas. This may require that a drainage easement be shown in the rear yard areas of Lots 102-124.
5. Notify staff one week in advance of the beginning of the Ohio EPA public comment period regarding wetland permitting.

MEF/JMH

[^1]$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

Community Development Planning Application


Engineers, Surveyors, Planners, Scientists

January 19, 2024

City of New Albany
99 W. Main Street
New Albany, OH 43054

Subject: Courtyards at Haines Creek
Preliminary Plat - Narrative

To the City of New Albany,
EC New Vision Ohio, LLC (Epcon) has received approval for the Preliminary Development Plan/rezoning of $63.5 \pm$ acres of land north of and adjacent to Central College Road and west of and adjacent to the FranklinLicking County boundary line in the City of New Albany. The subject land has been rezoned to I-PUD (Infill Planned Unit Development). Epcon is currently working through the Final Development Plan process to develop the property into a residential community consisting of 151 single family lots which will be $90 \%$ age-restricted in accordance with applicable federal law.

The proposed development has two existing streams located on the property. One in the northwest corner of the property and the other in the southeast corner. Stormwater management will be provided utilizing two proposed onsite retention basins located at the northwest and southeast corners of the site. The basins will be designed to meet the water quality and detention requirements of New Albany and the Ohio EPA. A storm sewer system will be constructed to collect and outlet stormwater from the proposed development to the stormwater basins. The stormwater facilities will outlet to the existing streams/wetlands located on the property. The proposed stormwater system will be designed to meet the necessary requirements of New Albany and the Ohio EPA.

A Traffic Access study has been completed/approved for the project and indicates no improvements are necessary to the existing public roadways (Central College or Jug Street) in the immediate opening/design year of the development. Licking County will require a 50' curb radius for the inbound right turn movement at the entrance of Jug Street to satisfy their access management regulations. An eastbound left turn lane at the entrance along Central College is warranted in the horizon year of 2034 after full build out of the development.

The proposed development will be designed with internal local residential public streets to provide vehicular circulation throughout the subdivision. The public streets will meet the City of New Albany public standards for pavement composition, width and emergency vehicle circulation. The development will be designed with public sanitary sewer and water with fire hydrants installed to provide fire protection meeting the City of New Albany standards.

As previously mentioned the proposed site will be $90 \%$ age restricted. This has a reduced impact on the City of New Albany School District while providing increased revenue for the school district. Please see enclosed School Impact letter.

The property was delineated for Waters of the U.S. in July, 2023. Wetlands and streams were delineated on the property. The U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (USACE) reviewed the delineation report and issued an Approved Jurisdictional Determination (AJD) for the site on October 11, 2023. Development of the site
would require impact to the existing wetlands. Environmental permitting application is being prepared and will be provided to the City once approved by the OEPA. Please see enclosed Environmental Permitting letter.

If you have any questions or require additional information, please do not hesitate to contact me directly at (614) 775-4396.

Sincerely,


Patricia A. Brown, PE
Sr. Project Manager/Associate
Enclosures: 2

Aaron L. Underhill
8000 Walton Parkway, Suite 260
New Albany, Ohio 43054
P: 614.335 .9321
F: 614.335.9329
aaron@uhlawfirm.com
March 16, 2023
Chris Christian
Planner II
City of New Albany
99 W. Main Street
New Albany, Ohio 43054

## RE: School Impact of Proposed Age-Restricted Residential Development (Courtyards at Haines Creek I-PUD)

## Dear Chris:

EC New Vision Ohio LLC ("Epcon") is in contract to purchase $63.5+$ / acres of real property located to the north of and adjacent to Central College Road and to west of and adjacent to the Franklin CountyLicking County boundary line in the City of New Albany. Epcon has submitted a rezoning application to the City which seeks the approval of an I-PUD, Infill Planned Unit Development zoning classification to allow for the development of a residential community consisting of 151 homes which will be $90 \%$ agerestricted in accordance with applicable federal law. The proposed community will be similar to the Courtyards at New Albany neighborhood that Epcon developed on State Route 605. The purpose of this letter is to highlight how this project will be financially beneficial to the New Albany-Plain Local School District (NAPLSD).

## Age Restriction

The pending rezoning application includes a commitment by Epcon to subject the 63.5+/- acres of singlefamily residential uses to age restrictions in accordance with the "Housing for Older Persons Exemption" (codified at 42 U.S.C. § 3607) (the "HOPA Exemption") of The Fair Housing Act (Title VIII of the Civil Rights Act of 1968, as amended, 42 U.S.C. 3601-3619) (the "Act"). The Act and the HOPA Exemption provide in part that, in order for a residential development to meet legal requirements to be age-restricted, at least 80 percent of the units in the development must have at least one occupant who is 55 years of age or older. Epcon proposes to exceed this minimum threshold with this proposal.

## School children from New Development

The school impact statement for the age-restricted Courtyards at New Albany and for the age-restricted Nottingham Trace subdivision to the north of that site assumed that 0.05 students per unit would be generated from the units that were age-restricted. The housing product in the current proposal is substantially similar to the Courtyards at New Albany and therefore the same student-per-home ratio should apply here. So, for purposes of this school impact analysis, the 0.05 students per unit will apply to $90 \%$ of the homes. While the remaining $10 \%$ of the units will not be age-restricted, they will include homes that are of the same designs and styles as the age-restricted units. Therefore, they are likely to generate more students, but not many. Just as was assumed in the Nottingham Trace subdivision's school impact statement, this letter assumes that 0.15 students per unit will be generated from the $10 \%$ of the units which are not age restricted.

Based on these assumptions, the proposed community is projected to generate 9 students:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& 0.9 \times 151 \text { units } \times 0.05 \text { students }=6.8 \text { students } \\
& \frac{0.1 \times 151 \text { units } \times 0.15 \text { students }=2.2 \text { students }}{9 \text { students }}
\end{aligned}
$$

On the other hand, the present zoning of the property is AG, Agricultural, allowing 1 housing unit per 5 acres. Therefore, the property would accommodate 12 traditional single-family homes right now ( 63.5 acres $/ 5$ acres per unit $=12.7$ units). Single-family homes are expected to generate 0.8 students per unit. Under the current AG zoning, the property would produce 10 schoolchildren ( 12 homes $\times 0.8$ students per home $=9.6$ students). The proposed development is projected to generate one less student than would the current zoning classification of the property, and the value that will be created for the school district with this proposal provides a far more beneficial result for the district.

The annual cost to educate a student in the NAPLSD is $\$ 12,311 .{ }^{1}$ Of this amount, $85.7 \%$ is locally funded and the remainder ( $14.3 \%$ ) is funded by the State of Ohio. ${ }^{2}$ Therefore, there is an annual local cost to educate one student in the NAPLSD of $\$ 10,550$. Using this number as a baseline, the costs to educate the students that would reside in Epcon's development is anticipated to be \$94,950 (9 students x $\$ 10,550$ local cost to educate one student $=\$ 94,950$ ). Development under the current AG zoning of the property would bring a cost to educate students of $\$ 105,500$ ( 10 students x $\$ 10,550$ local cost to educate one student $=\$ 105,500)$.

## School District Revenue from New Development

The average value of the homes to be constructed in this development is projected to be $\$ 575,000$. At this price, each unit will have an assessed value of $\$ 201,250(0.35 \times \$ 575,000$ value $=\$ 201,250)$. The 2022 effective residential millage rate (the most recent available) for the taxing district in which this property is located (Franklin County \#222) is 83.096 mills. The school district currently collects $58.39 \%$ of this millage. Therefore, the annual real property taxes collected by the school district before rollbacks for each home in the new neighborhood will equal $\$ 9,764$ ( $\$ 201,250$ Assessed Value x 0.083096 millage rate $\mathrm{x} 0.5839=\$ 9,764$ ). This number is reduced by the $2.5 \%$ owner-occupied property tax rollback, leaving $\$ 9,520$ available to the schools from each home. As a result, in total at full buildout this community of 151 homes will generate $\$ 1,437,520$ annually in school district revenue ( 151 homes $x \$ 9,520$ school taxes per home $=\$ 1,437,520$ total school taxes).

On the other hand, under the existing AG zoning 12 traditional single-family homes that could be constructed on the subject property today would be worth an estimated $\$ 1,000,000$ each. This would yield an assessed value per home of $\$ 350,000(0.35 \times \$ 1,000,000$ value $=\$ 350,000)$. Applying the effective millage rate, each homeowner would be required to pay $\$ 28,356$ in annual taxes after applying the owner-occupied tax rollback, of which $\$ 16,557$ would be paid to the NAPLSD. Across 12 homes, this would provide $\$ 198,684$ of total annual taxes to the school district.

## NAPLSD Fiscal Impact

The fiscal impact to the NAPLSD from the proposed development of the property by Epcon is substantial. The excess revenue to the school district after educating the relatively small number of students that may

[^2]reside in the community is $\$ 1,342.570(\$ 1,437,520$ school tax revenue - $\$ 94,950$ cost to educate students $=\$ 1,342,570$ surplus). This is enough surplus revenue to cover the costs of educating 127 students living elsewhere in the district. The current AG zoning of the property would generate a surplus of only $\$ 93,184$ ( $\$ 198,684$ school tax revenue - $\$ 105,500$ cost to educate students $=\$ 93,184$ surplus). So the net positive benefit to the NAPLSD from the development of the property in accordance with the requested IPUD zoning is $\$ 1,249,386$.

We look forward to more dialogue on this application and its benefits as we move through the City's review process.

Sincerely,


Aaron L. Underhill

Mr. Ryan Ohly<br>City of New Albany<br>Public Service<br>7800 Bevelhymer Road<br>New Albany, OH 43054

## Subject: Courtyards at Haines Creek - Environmental Permitting

Dear Mr. Ohly,
This letter serves to inform the City of New Albany of proposed wetland permitting coordination planned for the Courtyards at Haines Creek project.

The subject property was delineated for Waters of the U.S. in July, 2023. The U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (USACE) reviewed the report and issued an Approved Jurisdictional Determination (AJD) for the site on October 11, 2023. The AJD agreed with the findings of the report as submitted.

Construction of the proposed site plan would require impacts to approximately 2.56 acres of wetlands. All of these wetlands are isolated State Waters and subject to Ohio EPA jurisdiction. This will require a Level 2 Isolated Wetlands Permit (IWP). EMH\&T will be preparing the IWP application on behalf of Epson Communities.

Upon submission of the permit application, Ohio EPA will perform an initial review to determined completeness. Once the application is determined to be complete, Ohio EPA will place a public notice in a local newspaper and post the entire application on their webpage (Division of Surface Water) for public review and comment. Ohio EPA will review any comments received and notify EMH\&T if additional information is required before the technical review of the application is completed.

EMH\&T will notify the City of New Albany (via email) when the application is posted online.
If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me at (614) 775-4515.
Sincerely,
EVANS, MECHWART, HAMBLETON \& WILTON, INC.


Robert F. Milligan
Director of Environmental Services
Principal

PREPARED FOR:
EPCON COMMUNITIES 500 STONEHENGE PARKWAY DUBLIN, OHIO 43017 P: (614) 761-1010

OWNER: 2700 E. DUBLIN-GRANVILLE ROAD, SUITE 300 COLUMBUS, OHIO 43231

P: (614) 898-7200

SUBMITTAL: FEBRUARY 14, 2024

CIVIL ENGINEER, LAND PLANNER \& LANDSCAPE ARCHITECT

EM HT


## THE COURTYARDS AT HAINES CREEK

CITY OF NEW ALBANY, FRANKLIN COUNTY, OHIO PUD
PRELIMINARY PLAT
PHASES 1-3


INDEX OF DRAWINGS
SHEET 1: VICINITY MAP SHEET 2: EXISTING CONDITIONS PLAN SHEET 3: SITE PLAN

| Syam M. Dagaty | 2/14/24 |
| :---: | :---: |
| APPLICANT | DAIE |
| Sydrey L. Berwy | 2/14/24 |
| Professonal endinel | date |
| 9Mouthew $a$, quin | 2/14/24 |






[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Federal Register Part VI, Department of the Treasury, Volume 75, Number 237, pages 77471 and 77472, effective December 10, 2010; The Dictionary of Real Estate Appraisal, Fifth Edition, pages 122-123, 2010, The Appraisal Institute. Pursuant to Interagency Appraisal and Evaluation Guidelines.

[^1]:    cc: Josh Albright, Development Engineer Cara Denny, Engineering Manager
    Kylor Johnson, City Engineer
    Ryan Ohly, Development Department
    Dave Samuelson, P.E. Traffic Engineer

[^2]:    ${ }^{1} \mathrm{https}: / /$ www.napls.us/Page/1696
    ${ }^{2}$ https://www.napls.us/Page/1694

